#### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

)

)

)

ELECTRONIC PRIVACY INFORMATION CENTER,

Plaintiff,

v.

CUSTOMS AND BORDER PROTECTION,

Defendant.

Civil Action No: 14-1217 (RBW)

#### **NOTICE OF FILING VAUGHN INDEX**

Defendant, Customs and Border Protection ("Defendant"), through undersigned counsel,

hereby submits the attached Vaughn Index of withheld documents in the above captioned matter.

Defendant reserves the right to further amend and/or supplement the attached index if additional

information becomes available.

Respectfully submitted,

CHANNING D. PHILLIPS , DC Bar # 415793 United States Attorney for the District of Columbia

DANIEL F. VAN HORN, DC Bar # 924092 Chief, Civil Division

PATRICIA K. MCBRIDE, PA Bar # 54561 Assistant United States Attorney Civil Division 555 4th Street, NW, Room E-4808 Washington, DC 20530 Tel: 202.252.7123 Fax: 202.252.2599 Case 1:14-cv-01217-RBW Document 32-2 Filed 05/05/16 Page 2 of 14

Email: patricia.mcbride@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Defendant

PLAINTIFF BATES NUMBER/ EXHIBIT	DOCUMENT TITLE	EXEMPTION CLAIMED	CLASSIFICATION OF REDACTED INFORMATION
Exh. 1, 000005-37	Module 1 6.0	(b)(7)(E)	Module 1 provides an overview of AFI, including detailed tutorials, screen shots, and instructor notes to teach the law enforcement trainee techniques related to AFI, including how to access the AFI system, how to navigate AFI and its different components, and how to input, change, edit, and delete information in the AFI system. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 1, 000038-74	Module 2 6.0	(b)(7)(E)	Module 2 of the training materials provides an overview of the search and results functions of AFI. The training includes detailed instructions on how to use AFI's search features and techniques, build searches in the system, and navigate the system. Module 2 contains screen shots of the AFI system that specifically highlight how to accomplish the above-stated functions of AFI. The training module provides techniques, short-cuts, and other instructor notes to facilitate access to the system. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 1, 000075-96	Module 3 6.0	(b)(7)(E)	Module 3 of the training materials provides in- depth and detailed instructions regarding how to use AFI throughout a request for information cycle. The module contains PowerPoint slides that

# Case 1:14-cv-01217-RBW Document 32-2 Filed 05/05/16 Page 4 of 14

			demonstrate techniques on how to locate and search certain pages within AFI, how to create a request for information, and screen shots to educate the law enforcement trainee on how to navigate the system. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 1, 000097-115	Module 4 6.0	(b)(7)(E)	Module 4 of the training materials provides information on how to use AFI to develop "tasks," which are an inherent function of the law enforcement system. Similar to Module 3, which provided information on requests for information, Module 4 describes techniques and contains screen shots of the system and detailed instructor notes explaining how to best use and navigate the system to facilitate the user's law enforcement purpose. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 1, 000116-134	Module 5 6.0	(b)(7)(E)	Module 5 of the training materials provides information on techniques for using the AFI system to develop a particular tool called a "Product." Similar to Modules 3 and 4, it provides a detailed narrative (along with accompanying screen shots) that guide the user through the various processes, procedures, and techniques associated with products. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the

			unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 1,	Module 6 6.0	(b)(7)(E)	Module 6 of the training materials includes step-
000135-164			by-step instructions on how to use AFI's Projects
			application. Similar to Modules 3, 4, and 5, it
			provides a detailed narrative (along with
			accompanying screen shots) that guide the user
			through the various techniques, processes, and
			procedures associated with the use of AFI's
			Projects application. Disclosure of this information
			could enable unauthorized users to gain access to
			the system and alter, add, or delete information
			altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the
			system and allowing the unauthorized user to
			circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law
			enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 1,	AFI Quick	(b)(7)(E)	AFI Quick Reference Guide provides an overview
000165	Reference	15 perford dell'igge vecch	of key elements and techniques which can be used
	Card		by law enforcement officers within the AFI
			application. The guide also provides keyboard
			shortcuts and other techniques designed to assist in
			navigation of the AFI application. Disclosure of
			this information could enable unauthorized users
			to gain access to the system and alter, add, or
			delete information altogether, thus destroying the
			integrity of the system and allowing the
			unauthorized user to circumvent the law and
			potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations
			and proceedings.
Exh. 1,	Palantir Quick	(b)(7)(E)	Palantir Quick Reference Card provides an
000166	Reference	n ponta e s	overview of key elements, techniques which can
	Card		be used by law enforcement officers and related
			keyboard shortcuts designed to assist in navigation
			of the Palantir application within AFI. Disclosure
			of this information could enable unauthorized
			users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or
			delete information altogether, thus destroying the
			integrity of the system and allowing the

## Case 1:14-cv-01217-RBW Document 32-2 Filed 05/05/16 Page 6 of 14

	1		unauthorized user to circumvent the law and
			potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations
			and proceedings.
Exh. 1,	AFI Analyst	(b)(7)(E)	The "AFI Analyst Training Practical Exercise
000167-183	Training		Solutions" contains the answers to the practical
	Practical		exercises used to test a law enforcement trainee's
	Exercise		proficiency with using the key elements,
	Solutions		techniques and functionalities within the AFI
			application. Disclosure of this information could
			enable unauthorized users to gain access to the
			system and alter, add, or delete information
			altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the
			system and allowing the unauthorized user to
			circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law
			enforcement investigations and proceedings.
			Disclosure of this information could also
			reasonably allow a person to recognize identifiers
			that law enforcement uses to query CBP databases.
			Criminals could then circumvent the law by
			developing countermeasures to the search
			techniques.
Exh. 1,	Practical	(b)(7)(E)	The "Practical Exercises AFI Palantir" document
000184-203	Exercises AFI		contains the practical exercises used to test a law
	Palantir		enforcement trainee's proficiency with using the
			key elements, techniques, and functionalities
			within the AFI application. Disclosure of this
			information could enable unauthorized users to
			gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete
			information altogether, thus destroying the
			integrity of the system and allowing the
			unauthorized user to circumvent the law and
			potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations
			and proceedings. Disclosure of this information
			could also reasonably allow a person to recognize
			identifiers that law enforcement uses to query CBP
			databases. Criminals could then circumvent the
			law by developing countermeasures to the search
			techniques.

<b>P</b> 1 1	TT.	(1)(7)(E)	
Exh. 1,	How to	(b)(7)(E)	The "How to Request AFI Access" document
000204	Request AFI		provides detailed instructions on how to request
	Access		access to the system. Disclosure of this
			information could enable unauthorized users to
			gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete
			information altogether, thus destroying the
			integrity of the system and allowing the
			unauthorized user to circumvent the law and
			potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations
			and proceedings.
Exh. 1,	Approving	(b)(7)(E)	The "Approving AFI Access" document provides
000205	AFI Access		detailed instructions on how to approve access to
			the AFI application. Disclosure of this
			information could enable unauthorized users to
			gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete
			information altogether, thus destroying the
			integrity of the system and allowing the
			unauthorized user to circumvent the law and
			potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations
			and proceedings.
Exh. 1,	Approving	(b)(7)(E)	The "Approving AFI Consumer Access"
000206	AFI		document provides detailed instructions on how to
	Consumer		approve access to the AFI application. Disclosure
	Access		of this information could enable unauthorized
			users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or
			delete information altogether, thus destroying the
			integrity of the system and allowing the
			unauthorized user to circumvent the law and
			potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations
			and proceedings.
Exh. 1,	How to	(b)(7)(E)	The "How to Request AFI Consumer Access"
000207	Request AFI		document provides detailed instructions on how to
000207	Consumer		request access to the system. Disclosure of this
	Access		information could enable unauthorized users to
	Access		
			gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete
			information altogether, thus destroying the
			integrity of the system and allowing the
			unauthorized user to circumvent the law and

# Case 1:14-cv-01217-RBW Document 32-2 Filed 05/05/16 Page 8 of 14

			potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 1, 000208	Options for Setting up AFI Supervisors	(b)(7)(E)	The "Options for Setting up AFI Supervisors" document provides detailed options for setting up AFI supervisor accounts to request access to the system. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 2, 000001-2	AFI Trifold	(b)(7)(E)	This document provides an overview of AFI, including detailed screen shots and instructions on how to access the AFI system, related techniques used by law enforcement officers, and how to navigate AFI and its different components. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 2, 000003-8	AFI Program Overview	(b)(7)(E)	This document provides an overview of AFI, including detailed screen shots and instructions on how to access the AFI system, related techniques used by law enforcement, and how to navigate AFI and its different components. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 2, 000009-10	AFI Operational	(b)(7)(E)	This document lays out in detail the operational security posture of AFI. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to

## Case 1:14-cv-01217-RBW Document 32-2 Filed 05/05/16 Page 9 of 14

	Status and Security		gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 2, 000011-12	Summary of AFI Roles for Release	(b)(7)(E)	This Summary of AFI Roles provides an overview of AFI roles, including detailed capabilities, techniques, and usage of each AFI role. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 2, 000013-15	AFI User Security Access Definitions	(b)(7)(E)	The "User Security Access Definitions" document provides instructor notes to facilitate access to the system. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 2, 000016-33	Statement of Work	(b)(7)(E)	This Statement of Work identifies database- specific information identifying LexisNexis Products, the release of which would disclose the type of searches conducted, and the law enforcement techniques and methods by which data is searched, organized and reported. It also includes descriptions of security services and critical infrastructure, the release of which could reasonably allow a person to recognize technologies and infrastructure critical to safeguarding law enforcement information. Criminals could then circumvent the law by targeting these technologies and infrastructure that protect the information.

Exh. 2, 000034-49	Statement of Work	(b)(7)(E)	This Statement of Work identifies database- specific information identifying LexisNexis Products, the release of which would disclose the types of searches conducted, and the law enforcement techniques and methods by which data is searched, organized and reported. It also includes descriptions of security services, critical infrastructure, and encryption standards, the release of which could reasonably allow a person to recognize technologies and infrastructure critical to safeguarding law enforcement information. Criminals could then circumvent the law by targeting these technologies and infrastructure that protect the information.
Exh. 3, 000001-4	AFI Data Source Ranking Results	(b)(7)(E)	The "AFI Data Source Ranking Results" document is a summary of a stakeholder survey regarding potential data sources for ingestion into AFI. Disclosure of this information would give unauthorized persons insight into CBP operational and analytical techniques, tactics, and procedures. It could reasonably allow a person to recognize identifiers that law enforcement use to query CBP databases. Criminals could then circumvent the law by developing countermeasures to the search techniques.
Exh. 3, 000005	AFI Data Sources	(b)(7)(E)	"AFI Data Sources" contains information relating to the source of several different types of data that are available in AFI. The document explains how to search AFI for each source, and a description of data found in each source. Disclosure of this information would give unauthorized persons insight into CBP operational and analytical techniques, tactics, and procedures. It could reasonably allow a person to recognize identifiers that law enforcement use to query CBP databases. Criminals could then circumvent the law by developing countermeasures to the search techniques.

Exh. 3, 000006-7	AFI Data Sources	(b)(7)(E)	"AFI Data Sources" (separate from the above document) gives a detailed description of each data source and how it relates to AFI. It also describes where, specifically, in AFI the user would go to access the data source. Disclosure of this information would give unauthorized persons insight into CBP operational and analytical law enforcement techniques, tactics, and procedures. It could reasonably allow a person to recognize identifiers that law enforcement use to query CBP databases. Criminals could then circumvent the law by developing countermeasures to the search techniques.
Exh. 3, 000008	Prior to Training Checklist	(b)(7)(E)	The "AFI Pre-Training Checklist" document provides instructor notes on techniques to facilitate access to the system. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 3, 000009	AFI Pre- Training Check List	(b)(7)(E)	The "AFI Pre-Training Checklist" document provides instructor notes on techniques to facilitate access to the system. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 3, 000011	Training Day Checklist	(b)(7)(E)	The "Training Day Checklist" contains an internal e-mail address for operational questions related to AFI. The disclosure of this address could be used by an unauthorized person to circumvent the law by improperly seeking information about AFI, which could lead to the system becoming

## Case 1:14-cv-01217-RBW Document 32-2 Filed 05/05/16 Page 12 of 14

			compromised and law enforcement investigations and proceedings becoming disrupted.
Exh. 3, 000012-13	AFI Projects Meeting Minutes	(b)(7)(E)	The AFI Projects Meeting Minutes includes detailed CBP operational challenges, as well as decisions regarding how law enforcement officers may effectively use AFI's search features, build searches in the system, and techniques on navigating the system. Disclosure of this information could enable unauthorized users to gain access to the system and alter, add, or delete information altogether, thus destroying the integrity of the system and allowing the unauthorized user to circumvent the law and potentially disrupt law enforcement investigations and proceedings.
Exh. 3, 000014-18	Order for Supplies and Services 8/16/10	(b)(7)(E)	This document contains database-specific information identifying LexisNexis Products, the release of which would disclose law enforcement techniques and methods by which data is searched, organized and reported by CBP. This information is law enforcement sensitive information, because, when read as a whole with the rest of the Supply Order, it could reasonably allow a person to recognize identifiers that law enforcement uses to query LexisNexis databases via AFI. Criminals could then circumvent the law by developing countermeasures to the search techniques.
Exh. 3, 000019-24	Order for Supplies and Services 12/29/12	(b)(7)(E)	This document contains database-specific information identifying LexisNexis Products, the release of which would disclose law enforcement techniques and methods by which data is searched, organized and reported. This information is law enforcement sensitive information, because, when read as a whole with the rest of the Supply Order, it could reasonably allow a person to recognize identifiers that law enforcement uses to query LexisNexis databases via AFI. Criminals could then circumvent the law by developing countermeasures to the search techniques.

Exh. 3,	Order for	(b)(7)(E)	This document contains database-specific
EXII. 3, 000025-33		(b)(7)(E)	The second statement of
000023-33	Supplies and Services		information identifying LexisNexis Products, the release of which would disclose law enforcement
			Control and the second
	12/19/12		techniques and methods by which data is searched,
			organized and reported. This information is law
			enforcement sensitive information, because, when
			read as a whole with the rest of the Supply Order,
			it could reasonably allow a person to recognize
			identifiers that law enforcement uses to query
			LexisNexis databases via AFI. Criminals could
			then circumvent the law by developing
			countermeasures to the search techniques.
Exh. 3,	Order for	(b)(7)(E)	This document contains database-specific
000034-43	Supplies and		information identifying LexisNexis Products, the
	Services		release of which would disclose law enforcement
	12/27/13		techniques and methods by which data is searched,
			organized and reported. This information is law
			enforcement sensitive information, because, when
		2	read as a whole with the rest of the Supply Order,
			it could reasonably allow a person to recognize
			identifiers that law enforcement uses to query
			LexisNexis databases via AFI. Criminals could
			then circumvent the law by developing
			countermeasures to the search techniques.
Exh. 3,	Order for	(b)(7)(E)	This document contains database-specific
000044-56	Supplies and		information identifying LexisNexis Products, the
	Services		release of which would disclose law enforcement
	1/1/15		techniques and methods by which data is searched,
			organized and reported. This information is law
			enforcement sensitive information, because, when
			read as a whole with the rest of the Supply Order,
			it could reasonably allow a person to recognize
			identifiers that law enforcement uses to query
			LexisNexis databases via AFI. Criminals could
			then circumvent the law by developing
Exh. 3,	Order for	(b)(7)(E)	countermeasures to the search techniques.
		(b)(7)(E)	This document contains database-specific
000057-60	Supplies and		information identifying LexisNexis Products, the
			release of which would disclose law enforcement

# Case 1:14-cv-01217-RBW Document 32-2 Filed 05/05/16 Page 14 of 14

Services,	techniques and methods by which data is searched,
9/30/09	organized and reported. This information is law
	enforcement sensitive information, because, when
	read as a whole with the rest of the Supply Order,
	it could reasonably allow a person to recognize
	identifiers that law enforcement uses to query
	LexisNexis databases via AFI. Criminals could
	then circumvent the law by developing
	countermeasures to the search techniques.