

Orientation - March 11, 2019 - National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

Gable, Michael L CIV OSD OUSD R&E (US)

Sent: Friday, March 01, 2019 1:53 PM

To: Safra Catz, (b)(6); Steve Chien, (b)(6); Mignon Clyburn, (b)(6); Ken Ford, (b)(6); Jose-Marie Griffiths, (b)(6); Eric Horvitz, (b)(6); Andy Jassy, (b)(6); Gilman Louie, (b)(6); William Mark, (b)(6); Jason Matheny, (b)(6); Katharina McFarland, (b)(6); Andrew Moore, (b)(6); Eric Schmidt, (b)(6); Robert Work, (b)(6);

Cc: Safra Catz - EA, (b)(6); Chris Darby - EA, (b)(6); Ken Ford - EA, (b)(6); Jose-Marie Griffiths - EA, (b)(6); Eric Horvitz - EA, (b)(6); Andy Jassy - EA, (b)(6); Gilman Louie - EA, (b)(6); William Mark - EA, (b)(6); Andrew Moore - EA, (b)(6); Eric Schmidt - EA, (b)(6); Robert Work - Support Staff, (b)(6); Jose-Marie Griffiths - EA, (b)(6); Gilman Louie - EA, (b)(6); Andy Jassy - Support Staff, (b)(6); Gilman Louie - EA, (b)(6); Yll Bajraktari, (b)(6); DIB Staff, (b)(6); DIB Staff, (b)(6)

Attachments: NSCAI Orientation Agenda_~1.docx (21 KB)

Dear Commissioners,

We would like to provide additional information on our upcoming orientation on Monday, March 11, 2019.

Please let us know if you have any questions or concerns.

****ACTIONS NEEDED** (please send emails to **DIB Staff, (b)(6)**):

- Please let us know if you have any dietary restrictions
- Please respond with clearance information (#4 below)

We are excited to bring you all together for briefings and deliberation. We hope you will find the day informative and useful for structuring our way forward. Attached is the draft agenda.

The following message contains:

1. Commissioner Attendance
2. Venue Information
3. Meals & Attire
4. Clearance Information

1. Commissioner Attendance

Confirmed:

- Dr. Eric Schmidt
- Hon. Robert Work
- Dr. Steve Chien
- Ms. Mignon Clyburn
- Mr. Chris Darby
- Dr. Ken Ford
- Dr. Jose-Marie Griffiths
- Mr. Andy Jassy
- Mr. Gilman Louie
- Dr. William Mark
- Dr. Jason Matheny
- Hon. Katharina McFarland
- Dr. Andrew Moore

TBD:

- Dr. Eric Horvitz

Not Able to Attend:

- Ms. Safra Catz

2. Venue Information

The orientation will be held at the Center for Naval Analysis (CNA) in Clarendon, VA. The address is 3003 Washington Blvd, Arlington, VA 22201.

Transportation: CNA is located one block from the Clarendon Metro Station. There is a garage in the building (entrance on 11th Street) with limited parking for \$10/day. Additional parking is available at nearby garages and on the street (metered parking).

Check-In: All attendees will have to sign in at the front desk and present a government-issued ID.

Commissioners are responsible for their own travel to Washington, DC, hotel arrangements, and travel to/from the venue. Please retain your receipts and submit to me at the completion of your travel for reimbursement as discussed in my previous email on travel.

3. Meals & Attire

Please let us know if you have any dietary restrictions.

We are organizing delivery of breakfast and lunch. Coffee, tea, water, and soft drinks will be available throughout the day. All attendees will have to cover their own costs; money will be collected on the day of the orientation.

We are tentatively planning to hold a reception at CNA after the meeting has concluded. More information will be shared with you once we confirm details.

Attire: Business casual.

4. Clearance Information

Three of the briefing sessions will be at the SECRET level.

If you already have an active security clearance, please have your security office pass your clearance with the information here:

Contact: (b) (6), (b) (6), (b) (6)

Process: Clearances may be passed via JPAS or unclassified fax: SMO Code: (b) (6), Unclassified Fax: (b) (6).

Purpose of visit: National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence Orientation Briefings

Date of visit: March 11, 2019

Event POC: (b) (6), event coordinator.

If you do not have an active clearance, please email DIB Staff, (b)(6) and me ((b) (6)). We will be working to get you access to the classified briefings.

Very Respectfully,
Mike

MICHAEL L. GABLE
Office of the Under Secretary of Defense
for Research and Engineering
3030 Defense Pentagon (Rm (b) (6))
Washington, DC 20301-3030

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

[Non-DoD Source] Re: Final Trip Note - Orientation - March 11, 2019 - National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

Ylli Bajraktari [(b) (6)]

Sent: Saturday, March 09, 2019 7:04 AM

To: Gable, Michael L CIV OSD (USA)

Cc: Safra Catz, (b)(6); Steve Chien, (b)(6); Mignon Clyburn, (b)(6); Ken Ford, (b)(6); Jose-Marie Griffiths, (b)(6); Eric Horvitz, (b)(6); Andy Jassy, (b)(6); Gilman Louie, (b)(6); William Mark, (b)(6); Jason Matheny, (b)(6); Katharina McFarland, (b)(6); Andrew Moore, (b)(6); Eric Schmidt, (b)(6); Robert Work, (b)(6); Sarra Catz - EA, (b)(6); Chris Dalry - EA, (b)(6); Ken Ford - EA, (b)(6); Jose-Marie Griffiths - EA, (b)(6); Eric Horvitz - EA, (b)(6); Andy Jassy - EA, (b)(6); Gilman Louie - EA, (b)(6); William Mark - EA, (b)(6); Andrew Moore - EA, (b)(6); Eric Schmidt - EA, (b)(6); Robert Work - Support Staff, (b)(6); Jose-Marie Griffiths - EA, (b)(6); Gilman Louie - EA, (b)(6); Andy Jassy - Support Staff, (b)(6)

Attachments: NSCAI Annotated Bibliography.pdf (742 KB); TAMIA-KIR.DOC (35 KB); Colby_01-29-19.pdf (519 KB)

Dear Commissioners,

Please find attached the following documents:

1. Testimony by Dr. Elbridge Colby on the Implementation of the National Defense Strategy. Dr. Colby will present on Monday at the event.
2. Paper prepared by two of our speakers (Dr. Kirchhoff and Dr. Tama) on what makes Commissions successful - lessons from the past Commissions.
3. Dr. Schmidt asked our friends at the Defense Innovation Board (DIB) to pull together an annotated bibliography of AI to understand what the policy landscape looked like and what prior studies the government had commissioned. We truly appreciate the assistance provided by the DIB and MITRE in pulling together the attached document that will help us a lot going forward.

We look forward to seeing you all on Monday and to launch this important mission.

Best,

Ylli Bajraktari

Executive Director

National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

On Mar 8, 2019, at 6:28 PM, Gable, Michael L CIV OSD (USA) <[(b) (6)]> wrote:

Dear Commissioners,

We would like to share some final updates on our upcoming orientation on Monday, March 11, 2019. Please let us know if you have any questions or concerns. The hours of the meetings will be 9:00am – 5:30pm with coffee and pastries available 8:30am – 9:00am, and an informal reception 5:30pm – 6:30pm.

All of the briefings will be at the unclassified level on Monday. There is no longer a requirement to pass your clearance at this time. For those who are interested, we will arrange one-on-one or small group briefings for deep dives at a higher classification at a later date.

epic.org

EPIC-19-09-11-NSCAI-FOIA-20200430-4th-Production-pt1-March-11-Plenary-Materials

000661

EPIC-2019-001-000732

We are excited to bring you all together for briefings and deliberation. We hope you will find the day informative and useful for structuring our way forward. Attached is the final draft of the agenda.

The following message contains:

1. Commissioner Attendance
2. Venue Information
3. Meals & Attire
4. Clearance Information

1. Commissioner Attendance

Confirmed:

- Dr. Eric Schmidt
- Hon. Robert Work
- Dr. Steve Chien
- Ms. Mignon Clyburn
- Mr. Chris Darby
- Dr. Ken Ford
- Dr. Jose-Marie Griffiths
- Mr. Gilman Louie
- Dr. William Mark
- Dr. Jason Matheny
- Hon. Katharina McFarland
- Dr. Andrew Moore

Not Able to Attend:

- Ms. Safra Catz
- Dr. Eric Horvitz
- Mr. Andy Jassy

-

2. Venue Information

The orientation will be held at the Center for Naval Analysis (CNA) in Clarendon, VA. The address is **3003 Washington Blvd, Arlington, VA 22201**.

Transportation: CNA is located one block from the Clarendon Metro Station. There is a garage in the building (entrance on 11th Street) with limited parking for \$10/day. Additional parking is available at nearby garages and on the street (metered parking).

Check-In: All attendees will have to sign in at the front desk and present a government-issued ID.

Commissioners are responsible for their own travel to Washington, DC, hotel arrangements, and travel to/from the venue. Please retain your receipts and submit to me at the completion of your travel for reimbursement as discussed in my previous email on travel.

A secure room is available at the venue for storage of luggage for those proceeding directly to the airport after the event.

3. Meals & Attire

If you have not already done so, please let us know if you have any dietary restrictions.

We are organizing delivery of breakfast and lunch at a cost of \$23 per participant. Coffee, tea, water, and soft drinks will be available throughout the day. Attendees will cover their own costs, so money will be collected on the day of the orientation (cash, credit card, Venmo, or check).

We will have an informal reception for Commissioners and staff at CNA after the meeting has concluded.

Attire: Business casual.

The weather is projected to be sunny and about 60 degrees for a high in DC on Monday.

4. Clearance Information

All sessions are now UNCLASS. No action is required for passing clearances.

Very Respectfully,
Mike

MICHAEL L. GABLE
Chief of Staff
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

<NSCAI Orientation Agenda_Final.docx>

National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

Agenda for AI Orientation Seminar

Date: Monday, March 11, 2019, 0830-1730

Location: Center for Naval Analyses (CNA), 3003 Washington Blvd, Arlington, VA 22201

0830 - 0900 Light Breakfast and Coffee

Please arrive by 0845 at the latest to allow time to check in at the front desk and be ready to start by 0900.

0900 – 0915 Welcome Remarks

Speakers: **Dr. Eric Schmidt**, Commission Chairman
Hon. Bob Work, Commission Vice-Chairman
Mr. Ylli Bajraktari, Commission Executive Director (Admin Notes)

0910 - 0930 Introductions

0930 – 1000 Session One: [Unclassified] Threat Briefing from the IC

Speaker (confirmed): **Dr. Jeff Alstott**, Vice-Chair of the IC's AI Working Group / IARPA Program Manager for AI R&D / Co-Chair of the White House AI R&D Strategy

1000 – 1030 Session Two: [Unclassified] The National Security Strategy and The National Defense Strategy

Speakers (confirmed): **Dr. Frank Hoffman**, Distinguished Research Fellow, Center for Strategic Research, NDU and **Mr. Elbridge Colby**, former Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense for Strategy who led the NDS team

1030 - 1045 Break

1045 - 1130 Session Three: [Unclassified] DoD AI Strategy & Establishing the Joint Artificial Intelligence Center (JAIC)

Speakers (confirmed): **Lt Gen John N.T. Shanahan**, Director of the JAIC and **Col Drew Cukor**, Project Maven, and **Mr. Brendan McCord**

1130 – 1145 Session Four: [Unclassified] Defense Innovation Board

Speaker (confirmed): **Mr. Joshua Marcuse**, Executive Director, Defense Innovation Board

1145 - 1215 Session Five: [Unclassified] DARPA's "AI Next" Campaign

Speakers (confirmed): **Dr. Steve Walker**, Director of DARPA, and **Dr. Peter Highnam**, Deputy Director of DARPA

- 1215 - 1245 Lunch Break**
- 1245 - 1330 Session Six: [Unclassified] The View from the Hill**
- 1330 - 1400 Session Seven: [Unclassified] The View from the Commerce Department & Export Controls**
Speaker: (confirmed) Ms. Nazak Nikakhtar, Assistant Secretary, Industry & Analysis, Performing the Non-Exclusive Duties of the Under Secretary for Industry and Security, United States Department of Commerce
- 1400 - 1430 Session Eight: [Unclassified] Lessons from Past Commissions - How to Maximize Impact**
Speakers (confirmed): **Dr. Jordan Tama**, American University and **Dr. Christopher Kirchhoff**, Schmidt Futures
- 1430 - 1500 Break**
- 1500 - 1530 *Commissioners and Staff Only***
Session Nine: Commission Administrative Progress & Next Steps
Speakers: **Mr. Ylli Bajraktari**, Commission Executive Director, and **Mr. Mike Gable**, Commission Chief of Staff
- 1530 - 1700 *Commissioners and Staff Only***
Working Session
Moderators: **Dr. Eric Schmidt**, Commission Chairman
Hon. Bob Work, Commission Vice-Chairman
- 1700 – 1730 Wrap Up**
Moderators: **Dr. Eric Schmidt**, Commission Chairman
Hon. Bob Work, Commission Vice-Chairman
- 1730 - 1830 Reception at same location**

From: [Yli Bajraktari](#)
To: [Robert Work](#); [Eric Horvitz](#); [Andrew Moore](#); [Steve Chien](#); [Ken Ford](#); [Safra Catz](#); [Katharina Mcfarland](#); [Mignon Clyburn](#); ["Griffiths, José Marie"](#); [Jason Matheny](#); [Chris Darby](#); [Gilman Louie](#); [Andy Jassy, \(b\)\(6\)](#); [Eric Schmidt](#); [Gable, Michael L CIV OSD OSD \(USA\)](#)
Cc: [Michael Gable](#)
Subject: [Non-DoD Source] National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence - March 11 Documents
Date: Monday, March 18, 2019 9:55:34 AM
Attachments: [TAB 1. NSCAI First Plenary SOC FINAL.pdf](#)
[TAB 2. NSCAI Orientation CNA Attendee List.pdf](#)
[TAB 3. NSCAI Plenary Minutes FINAL.docx](#)
[TAB 4. NSCAI Briefing.pptx](#)
[TAB 5. 2018-National-Defense-Strategy-Summary.pdf](#)
[TAB 6. Memo on lessons frmo past commissions.DOC](#)
[TAB 7. AIM-Strategy.pdf](#)
[TAB 8. NSCAI Working Groups.pptx](#)

Dear Commissioners,

Please find attached the following documents from our first plenary meeting on March 11, 2019.

TAB 1. Meeting's Summary of Conclusion

TAB 2. Attendee List

TAB 3. Detailed Discussion notes from Plenary

TAB 4. IARPA Threat Briefing

TAB 5. National Defense Strategy Summary

TAB 6. Memo on lessons from past commissions

TAB 7. The AIM Strategy - A Strategy for Augmenting Intelligence Using Machines

TAB 8. Sub-Working Groups Proposed Topics

Please let us know if there is anything else you need from the team.

Best, Ylli

NSCAI, MARCH 11 PLENARY MEETING ATTENDEES

<u>First Name</u>	<u>Last Name</u>	<u>Type</u>
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Commissioner (sub)
Jeff	Alstott	Speaker
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	DIB
Yll	Bajraktari	Staff
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Staff
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Speaker
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Staff
Steve	Chien	Commissioner
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Speaker
Mignon	Clyburn	Commissioner
Elbridge	Colby	Speaker
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Staff
Drew	Cukor	Speaker
Chris	Darby	Commissioner
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Staff
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Hill - HASC
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Staff
Ken	Ford	Commissioner
Mike	Gable	Staff
Jose-Marie	Griffiths	Commissioner
Martin	Heinrich	Hill - Senator
Peter	Highnam	Speaker
Frank	Hoffman	Speaker
Christopher	Kirchhoff	Speaker
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Speaker
Gilman	Louie	Commissioner
Joshua	Marcuse	DIB
William	Mark	Commissioner
Jason	Matheny	Commissioner
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Hill - Staffer
Brendan	McCord	Speaker
Katharina	McFarland	Commissioner
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Staff
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Staff
Jerry	McNerney	Hill - Congressman
Andrew	Moore	Commissioner
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Staff
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Staff
Nazak	Nikakhtar	Speaker
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Staff
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Hill - Staffer

Eric	Schmidt	Commissioner
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	DIB
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Speaker
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Hill - Staffer
Elise	Stefanik	Hill - Congresswoman
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Hill - SASC
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Speaker
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Hill - HASC
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Speaker
Robert	Work	Commissioner
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Staff
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Hill - HPSCI
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	Hill - HPSCI
(b) (6)	(b) (6)	JAIC

Plenary Session #1, March 11, 2019

Summary of Discussion and Conclusions

The Commission chair and Vice-chair:

- Stated that the objective for the first plenary session was to decide what the commissioners want to do, and to develop the operating plan and responsibilities.
- Stressed that the commission needs the voice and views of all of the commissioners.
- Emphasized that the Commission must do more than describe, complain, and report. It should focus on legislation, policy, and outreach opportunities to advance the agenda.
- Until such time as the Commission is able to form its recommendations and positions, asked that when commissioners speak publicly on AI they make clear they are speaking in their private capacity, if appropriate.

Commissioners received briefs on: AI threats, the National Defense Strategy, the role of Congress, the Defense Department's AI organization, DARPA's AI research, export controls, and best practices from past commissions. (See detailed notes and slides attached.)

Commissioners agreed:

- To meet every other month in plenary session for a full day. Commissioners' attendance is expected. A designee may attend provided they are adequately prepared and serve in a non-voting capacity.
- To establish five working groups structured around broad categories that will meet monthly. Each WG will have three commissioners, two permanent staff, and an outside subject matter expert. WG's include: 1) AI research, 2) national security applications for AI, 3) AI for the betterment of citizens and the economy; 4) preparing citizens and the workforce for AI; and 5) ensuring international competitiveness and cooperation in AI.
- All meetings should rotate locations to maximize convenience for commissioners and allow the Commission to engage with AI communities around the country.
- The principle of inclusivity applies to all commission meetings--all Commission members and staff are welcome at any Commission meeting.
- The final report will include both an unclassified and classified portion.

Commissioners noted several additional themes to incorporate into the Commission's work:

- What China is doing.

- The challenge of making Americans “AI optimists.”
- The relationship between AI and other emerging fields such as synthetic biology.
- The importance of analyzing the role AI can play in enhancing fairness and justice.

Commission staff will:

- Work to expedite TS/SCI clearances for the next plenary.
- Explore potential use of a group messaging system.
- Advise on options for cloud-based document storage.
- Provide regular media guidance to commissioners.
- Develop a congressional engagement strategy.
- Provide official email accounts for conducting Commission business.

Attached

TAB 2. Attendance List

TAB 3. Detailed Discussion notes from Plenary

TAB 4. IARPA Threat Briefing

TAB 5. National Defense Strategy Summary

TAB 6. Memo on lessons from past commissions

TAB 7. The AIM Strategy - A Strategy for Augmenting Intelligence Using Machines

TAB 8. Sub-Working Groups Proposed Topics