

From: Yli Bajraktari (b) (6)
 Subject: NSCAI - Status Update
 Date: April 24, 2019 at 1:14 PM
 To: Eric Schmidt (b) (6), Robert Work (b) (6), Safra Catz (b) (6), Steve Chien (b) (6), Mignon Clyburn (b) (6), Chris Darby (b) (6), Ken Ford (b) (6), José Marie Griffiths (b) (6), Eric Horvitz (b) (6), Andy Jassy (b) (6), Gilman Louie (b) (6), William Mark (b) (6), Jason Matheny (b) (6), Katharina McFarland (b) (6), Andrew Moore (b) (6)
 Cc: NSCAI Staff, (b) (6)

Dear Commissioners,

I want to provide you with an update across all our efforts. This email will cover the following issues:

1. Status of the Working Groups
2. Plenary Session in May (dates and location)
3. Outreach and Engagement
4. Personnel Update

****IMPORTANT REMINDER:** [Please complete establishing your G-suite accounts. Please follow this link for a step-by-step guidance that Mike Gable has prepared for you**](#)

ANOTHER IMPORTANT ISSUES: Per my request, Dr. Schmidt and Mr. Work authorized me to seek from our Congressional committees a 5-month extension in the Commission's mandate, from October 2020 to March 2021. I believed this was warranted given the delay in establishing the Commission due to government shutdown and other factors. We will work with each of you to determine on whether you would be willing to serve in the Commission during this additional time.

1. STATUS OF THE WORKING GROUPS

Working Group 1 - Maintaining Global Leadership in AI Research (Commissioners: Moore, Schmidt, Horvitz)

Proposed topic: (b) (5)

Status of the WG: Meeting scheduled for 1500-1700 May 8th, location TBC.

Next Steps: Finalize the agenda and briefers.

—

Working Group 2 - Maintaining Global Leadership in National Security AI Application (Catz, Ford, McFarland, Jassy, Chien)

Proposed topic: (b) (5)

Status of the WG: Meeting will be held on Friday (April 26th) at MITRE in Washington DC. [See draft agenda](#)

Next Steps: Once the meeting has concluded, the team will prepare a summary of conclusions and will provide an out brief to the Plenary meeting on May 20th.

Working Group 3: Public-Private Partnerships for the Prosperity and Security of our Citizens (Clyburn, Jassy, Chien)

Proposed topic: (b) (5)

Status of the WG: Meeting scheduled for May 7th in Silicon Valley. [See draft agenda](#).

Next Steps: Once the meeting has been completed, the team will prepare a summary of conclusions and will provide an out brief to the Plenary meeting on May 20th. After this meeting, the working group will shut down and the Staff will treat this effort as a Special Project and continue the work on this important topic.

Working Group 4: Preparing Our Citizens for an AI Future (Griffiths, Work, Mark, Clyburn)

Proposed Topic: (b) (5)

Status of the WG: Staff shared a discussion paper with the Commissioners.

Next Steps: Staff will work with the Commissioners to schedule the working group meeting before May 20th. [See draft agenda.](#)

Working Group 5: Ensuring International Competitiveness in AI (Matheny, Darby, Louie)

Proposed Topic: (b) (5)

Status of the WG: Meeting scheduled for May 7th in Washington DC. Location TBC. [See draft agenda.](#)

Next Steps: Once the meeting has concluded, the team will prepare a summary of conclusions and will provide an out brief to the Plenary meeting on May 20th.

2. Plenary Session in May (dates and location)

Date: May 20th in Cupertino (California)

Location: Classified (our team will work with your teams regarding this issue).

Hotel Arrangements: (b) (6) from the Commission's staff is booking rooms for all at the Juniper Hotel in Cupertino.

3. Outreach and Engagements

- We met with (b) (6) (b) (6) to Senator Mitch McConnell). (b) (5)

- We met with Michael Kratsios (Chief Technology Officer at the White House and Director of Office of Science and Technology) and Dr. Lynne Parker (Assistant Director for AI at the OSTP). (b) (5)

- We met with (b) (6) (staffer for Sen Henrich) (b) (5)

- We met with (b) (6) and (b) (6) of Govini who briefed us on (b) (5)

- We spoke with (b) (6) (SRI) and (b) (6) (Stanford) from the AI Index effort (b) (5)

- We met with the Computing Community Consortium (CCC) and the Association for the advancement of Artificial Intelligence (AAAI) (b) (5)

4. Personnel Update

- Last Monday, we were joined by four new members: (b) (6) (Working Group One); (b) (6) (detailed from the U.S. Army and will work on Working Group Two); (b) (6) (Special Assistant); (b) (6) (Working Group Four and Legislative Affairs). This brings the total staff to 9 and we anticipate six more to join us next Monday.

Please let us know if you have any questions or need more information.

Best,

Ylli Bajraktari
Executive Director
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

Subject: NSCAI - Status Update

Date: Monday, May 13, 2019 at 12:46:12 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Yll Bajraktari

To: Eric Schmidt, Robert Work, Safra Catz, Steve Chien, Mignon Clyburn, Chris Darby, Ken Ford, (b)(6), José Marie Griffiths, Eric Horvitz, Andy Jassy, (b)(6), Gilman Louie, William Mark, Jason Matheny, Katharina McFarland, Andrew Moore

CC: NSCAI Staff, (b)(6)

Dear Commissioners,

Below is an update across all of our efforts prepared by NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6). This email will cover:

1. Status of the working groups
2. Plenary session information
3. Outreach and engagement
4. Personnel update
5. Other items

IMPORTANT: We have held four working group meetings with another one planned for Friday, May 17th. Thank you all for your help and for outstanding conversations.

IMPORTANT #1: Official email accounts: Please establish your G-suite accounts, if you have not done so already. Going forward, all Commission business will be conducted through these accounts. ([Link to instructions here](#))

IMPORTANT #2: We look forward to seeing you all on May 20th for our next plenary meeting ([see draft agenda](#)). All should meet (regardless of where you are staying) at the lobby of the [Juniper Hotel](#) at 0830 AM on May 20th. We will notify your staff.

IMPORTANT #3: We still have Commissioners who have not submitted their paperwork. Unfortunately, you will not be able to attend the morning session (until lunch).

1—Status of the working groups

WG1 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI Research (Commissioners: Moore, Schmidt, Horvitz)

Status: First meeting was held by video conference on May 8. (b) (5)

(summary of discussion [here](#))

WG2 – Maintaining Global Leadership in National Security AI Applications (Catz, Ford, McFarland, Jassy, Chien)

Status: First meeting was held April 26 in McLean, VA. (b) (5)

(summary of discussion [here](#)). The WG will prepare a framework outlining its way ahead and brief the larger group at the May 20 plenary.

WG3 – Exploiting AI for the Betterment of Our Citizens and Economy (Clyburn, Jassy, Chien)

Status: Meeting was held May 7 in Silicon Valley (summary of discussion [here](#)). The working group has now been disbanded; going forward, the staff will pursue these subjects as a special project. The special project will focus on public private partnerships and expanding cooperation between DoD and the National Security Innovation Base for AI/ML development and applications.

WG4 – Preparing Our Citizens for an AI Future (Griffiths, Work, Mark, Clyburn)

Status: First meeting will be held May 17 in Crystal City. The [agenda](#) will address (b) (5)

WG5 – Ensuring International Competitiveness in AI (Matheny, Darby, Louie)

Status: First meeting was held May 7 at the Pentagon (summary of discussion [here](#)). The group (b) (5) The next meeting will be June 20, (b) (5)

2—Plenary sessions

We are developing an agenda in three main parts: 1) U.S. Government briefings on the policy context, 2) Debriefs from our Working Groups, and 3) Discussion on the way forward.

We are working with your staffs on details and logistics. More information will be forthcoming separately.

Next plenary dates (to be confirmed): **July 11th in California.**

3—Outreach and engagement

Senate Majority/Minority Leadership: Staff met with the national security advisers to Sen. McConnell and Sen. Schumer. (b) (5)

White House: Staff met with Deputy Chief of Staff for Policy Chris Liddell to discuss how the Commission's work can be synchronized with other USG efforts.

4—Personnel update

(b) (6) joined the staff as Chief Technology Advisor. He comes to the Commission from NIST, where he has worked for over 30 years and served as a computer scientist, manager, and technical lead in the areas of pattern recognition, biometrics, and AI.

(b) (6) joined us last Monday from the Office of the Vice Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff.

(b) (6) joined us today from Department of State and her last job focused on cyber related issues.

(b) (6) recently graduated from the Carnegie Mellon University with the degree on AI and ethics.

(b) (6) joined us last week and his recent job was in the House Armed Services Committee.

(b) (6) joined us last week and his recent position was in the Office of Management and Budget.

(b) (6) joined us last week and his recent position was working for the Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff.

(b) (6) joined us last week and his recent position was working on arms control issues at the Department of State.

The staff has reached 16.

5—Other items

Talking points: The staff has prepared a set of general talking points that commissioners may use to describe the Commission's work. We will update them as needed. ([Link here](#))

Staff Offsite: On May 10, the staff held an all-day offsite to promote team building, to refine each Working Group's objectives and plans, and to develop a timeline for the assessment phase of our work (from now until November). At the end, the staff provided an out-brief to Vice Chairman Bob Work.

China news stories: The Commission is gaining attention more broadly, including in China, where we have featured in recent news stories, analyses, and Chinese language translations of our mandate.

We look forward to seeing you all next Monday in Cupertino.

Best, Ylli

Subject: NSCAI - Status Update

Date: Tuesday, May 28, 2019 at 12:36:46 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: YII Bajraktari

To: Eric Schmidt, Robert Work, Safra Catz, Steve Chien, Mignon Clyburn, Chris Darby, Kenneth Ford, José Marie Griffiths, Eric Horvitz, Andy Jassy, (b)(6), Gilman Louie, William Mark, Jason Matheny, Katharina McFarland, Andrew Moore

CC: NSCAI Staff, (b)(6)

Attachments available until Jun 27, 2019

Dear Commissioners,

Thank you all for an excellent plenary meeting in California on the 20th.

Below is an update across all of our efforts prepared by (b) (6) on the Commission's staff. This email will cover:

1. Follow up from the May 20 plenary
2. Working Group updates
3. Outreach and engagement
4. Other

IMPORTANT: Official email accounts: Please establish your G-suite accounts, if you have not done so already (ONLY TWO LEFT TO GO). Going forward, all Commission business will be conducted through these accounts. ([Link to instructions here](#))

IMPORTANT #2: For breakfast and lunch at the May 20 plenary, please reimburse Mike Gable (\$35).

1 — May 20 Plenary Follow Up

Please see attached the following documents:

- [Summary of Conclusions](#)
- OSTP briefing slides
- OSTP suggested priority areas for NSCAI
- [Working list of alternative AI definitions](#)
- Liza Tobin article on China and global governance

Special Projects: To contribute to one or more of the three Special Projects now underway, please contact the following staff members:

- Public-private partnerships – NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
- Responsible use of AI – NSCAI Staff Member (b)(6)
- Data to support AI – NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Next Plenary: July 11 in California. We will be in touch with your staffs on details and logistics.

2 — Working Group Updates

WG1 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI Research (Moore, Schmidt, Horvitz)

Status: The next WG meeting (date TBD) (b) (5)

[REDACTED]

WG2 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI National Security Applications (Catz, Ford, McFarland, Jassy, Chen)

Status: Next meeting is planned for June 11 in DC. (b) (5)

[REDACTED]

WG3 – Preparing Our Citizens for an AI Future (Griffiths, Work, Mark, Clyburn)

Status: Next meeting will be on June 7. (b) (5)

WG4 – Ensuring International Competitiveness in AI (Matheny, Darby, Louie)

Status: Next meeting will be on June 20. (b) (5)

SP / Partnerships – The Special Project on public-private partnerships will hold a meeting during the week of June 24-28 (date TBD) to discuss (b) (5)

SP / Ethics – The Special Project on ethics and responsible use of AI aims to hold an initial briefing in July. NSCAI has enlisted two leading AI ethicists to advise on this project: (b) (6) of the Johns Hopkins Applied Physics Lab, and (b) (6) of Carnegie Mellon.

SP / Data – The Special Project on data to support AI will focus on the challenges of managing data to enable USG applications of AI technologies, and will be led by ^{NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)}, Chief Technology Advisor to the Commission.

3 — Outreach and Engagement

In the past two weeks NSCAI staff has engaged with the Defense Innovation Board; Army Futures Study Group; DoD Joint AI Center; Office of Senator Gary Peters; Yale; Georgetown; National Security Innovation Network; DoD Office of Commercial and Economic Analysis; French Embassy; State Department . . . and many others.

4. — **Other**

- MITRE shared a report with us on “China AI Development Report 2018” - please see chapter 2, pages 33-44, which includes several views of AI talent, including: global talent, top talent per country, talent at universities, and research institutions, and at leading private sector companies across the globe.

- Deloitte and Uptake are putting together a conference on June 26th, (Ritz Carlton) and they have invited any of the Commissioners to speak. Please let us know if you are interested and we will work with you to provide talking points. etc.

[Click to Download](#)

NSCAI-OSTP-Suggestions-May-2019.pdf
283 KB

[Click to Download](#)

NSCAI-OSTP-May-2019.pdf
3.4 MB

[Click to Download](#)

TNSR-Vol-2-Issue-1-Tobin.pdf
692 KB

[Click to Download](#)

China_AI_development_report_2018.pdf
15.7 MB

Hearing Memo



Summary of House Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence (HPSCI) Hearing: *“The National Security Challenge of Artificial Intelligence, Manipulated Media, and ‘Deepfakes’”*

Chairman Adam Schiff (D-CA) | Ranking Member Devin Nunes (R-CA)


Thursday, June 13, 2019 | 9:00 AM

Overview

This morning, HPSCI convened an open hearing on the national security challenges of artificial intelligence (AI), manipulated media, and “deepfake” technology. This is the first House hearing devoted specifically to examining deepfakes and other types of AI-generated synthetic data. The full hearing recording can be seen [here](#). The witness panel included (Statement of records are included in the speakers’ names as hyperlinks):

- [Danielle Citron](#), Professor of Law, University of Maryland Francis King Carey School of Law
- [Jack Clark](#), Policy Director, OpenAI
- [Dr. David Doermann](#), Professor, SUNY Empire Innovation and Director, Artificial Intelligence Institute, University at Buffalo
- [Clint Watts](#), Distinguished Research Fellow, Foreign Policy Research Institute, and Senior Fellow, Alliance for Securing Democracy, German Marshall Fund
 - His article written on [Advanced Persistent Manipulators](#).

(b) (5)





Hearing Memo

(b) (5)

Key Takeaway for NSCAI: NSCAI Legislative Staff will stay in touch with the Chairman and Ranking Member as the Committee considers this topic and potentially develops legislation.

Special Project on AI Data

Proposed Framework

Commission Mandate: Consider the methods and means necessary to advance the development of artificial intelligence, machine learning, and associated technologies by the United States to comprehensively address the **national security and defense** needs of the United States.

Special Project Objective: Identify strategic opportunities to address AI data and infrastructure needs and challenges to maintain US global leadership and strengthen US national security and defense.

Special Project Approach: Assess the AI data landscape and develop recommendations to accelerate AI technology innovation to address national security and defense needs. This includes attention to:

1. AI data and infrastructure to advance AI research (WG1)
2. AI data and infrastructure to promote AI operational application (WG2)
3. AI data for workforce development and training (WG3)
4. AI data sharing among allies to maintain competitive advantage over adversaries (WG4)

Guiding Questions:

1. (b) (5)
 - a. (b) (5)
 - b. (b) (5)
2. (b) (5)
 - a. (b) (5)
 - b. (b) (5)
 - c. (b) (5)
 - d. (b) (5)
3. (b) (5)

Notional Timeline

Assessment Phase (June-October 2019)



Objective: (b) (5)

June-August

Objective: (b) (5)

Source: (b) (5)

September

Topic: Stakeholders AI Data Workshop

Objective: (b) (5)

1. (b) (5)
2. (b) (5)
3. (b) (5)
4. (b) (5)

Possible briefers: *(List to be developed and include subject matter experts from defense/intelligence, industry, and academia)*

October: Commission plenary meeting (present workshop findings)

Analysis Phase (November 2019-October 2020)

Objective: (b) (5)

Recommendation Phase (November 2020 – March 2021)

Objective: (b) (5)

Subject: Status Update from the National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

Date: Monday, July 1, 2019 at 9:58:57 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Yll Bajraktari

To: Eric Schmidt, Robert Work, Safra Catz, Steve Chien, Mignon Clyburn, Chris Darby, Kenneth Ford, José Marie Griffiths, Eric Horvitz, **Andy Jassy, (b)(6)**, Gilman Louie, William Mark, Jason Matheny, Katharina McFarland, Andrew Moore

CC: **NSCAI Staff, (b)(6), NSCAI Commissioners, (b)(6)**

Dear Commissioners,

Below is an update across all of our efforts prepared by **(b)(6)** (Commission Staff), including:

1. Chair and Vice Chair Congressional Briefing
2. Working Group / Special Project Updates
3. Plenary Information
4. Outreach and Engagement
5. Personnel Update

IMPORTANT: We look forward to seeing you all on July 11th in Cupertino, CA for our next plenary. Materials will be sent no later than Monday COB.

1—Chair and Vice Chair Congressional Briefing

Dr. Schmidt and Mr. Work held very successful briefings with House and Senate staff on June 28. The briefings were organized on a bipartisan basis by the leadership offices in each chamber. Turnout was impressively high. Staff showed strong interest in the Commission's work and raised important issues and questions.

Talking points drafted for the briefing are [attached here](#).

2—Working Group / Special Project Updates

WG1 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI Research (Moore, Schmidt, Horvitz)

Status: The group held its second meeting on June 28 at the Pentagon, **(b)(5)**

Summary of discussion is being finalized and will be sent out shortly.

WG2 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI National Security Applications (Catz, Ford, McFarland, Jassy, Chien)

Status: Staff members are conducting engagements with DoD and IC organizations to **(b)(5)**

During the next two months, staff will visit some of the most prominent labs and research centers to conduct an analysis for the Commissioners based on the last meeting due out.

WG3 – Preparing Our Citizens for an AI Future (Griffiths, Work, Mark, Clyburn)

Status: The group continued to engage with DoD, the IC, and other parts of government. **(b)(5)**

(b) (5). The group will continue to solicit input and study hiring practices, and begin to plan the next WG meeting. The staff is also working on the due outs from the last working group.

WG4 – International Competitiveness and Cooperation in AI (Matheny, Darby, Louie)

Status: The group held its second meeting on June 20, focused on cooperation with allies and partners. (b) (5)

(Link to summary of discussion [here](#))

Special Project / Partnerships – Special Project staff will visit the Naval Surface Warfare Center Crane, in Indiana, on July 8. (b) (5)

. (Draft agenda available [here](#))

Special Project / Ethics – (b) (5)

Special Project / Data – The Special Project continues to invite Commissioners' input and suggestions on projects, organizations, or experts who might offer relevant insights and experiences. Some initial ideas based on WG4 meeting with the allies are emerging.

3—Plenary Information

The next plenary meeting is scheduled for July 11 in Cupertino, CA (same location as the May meeting). We are coordinating with your staffs on details.

4—Outreach and Engagement

In the past few weeks, NSCAI staff members have engaged with the Joint AI Center, Air Force Research Lab, Army AI Task Force, DARPA, Johns Hopkins Applied Physics Lab, NGA, Yale Law School, CNAS, CNA, Univ. of Chicago, Joint Staff, Ethical Intelligence, RAND, DOE, DIB, Georgetown CSET, Carnegie Mellon SEI . . . and many others.

We are tracking staff engagements in a spreadsheet [linked here](#). So far, we have conducted more than 80 engagements with experts from academia, private sector, think tank, etc.

5—Personnel Update

We have welcomed two new staff members:

-- Michael Lueptow has joined from the Senate Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs Committee to serve as General Counsel to the Commission.

-- (b) (6) has joined from Georgetown University to serve on the Research and Analysis Team, with a focus on supporting Working Group 4.

Please let us know if you have any questions or need more info.

See you next week.

Ylli

Subject: NSCAI Bimonthly Status Update

Date: Tuesday, July 23, 2019 at 9:16:57 AM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Yll Bajraktari

To: Eric Schmidt, Robert Work, Safra Catz, Steve Chien, Mignon Clyburn, Chris Darby, Kenneth Ford, José Marie Griffiths, Eric Horvitz, **Andy Jassy, (b)(6)**, Gilman Louie, William Mark, Jason Matheny, Katharina McFarland, Andrew Moore

CC: **NSCAI Staff, (b)(6), NSCAI Commissioners, (b)(6)**

Dear Commissioners,

Thank you again for an excellent plenary in Cupertino on July 11. Below is an update across all of our efforts prepared by **NSCAI Staff Member (b)(6)**, including:

1. Plenary Follow-up
2. Working Group / Special Project Updates
3. Outreach and Engagement
4. Additional Items

1—Plenary Follow-up

Please find the following attached:

- [Summary of Conclusions](#)
- [Final Preliminary Report](#), which we intend to submit to the House and Senate Armed Services Committees by the end of this month.
- [Guidance](#) to help Working Groups develop research memos in advance of their September meetings
- [November conference draft agenda](#)

IMPORTANT: We are working on the “beliefs” document and we will send it to you with the next status update

2—Working Group / Special Project Updates

WG1 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI Research (Moore, Schmidt, Horvitz)

The next WG meeting, in September, will focus on perspectives from the AI research community - including on **(b) (5)**. These perspectives will inform the group's assessments of funding options and research priorities.

WG2 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI National Security Applications (Catz, Ford, McFarland, Jassy, Chien)

The group is continuing to **(b) (5)**. In the next two months, staff will visit service and academic labs and research centers to inform the group's initial assessments and prepare for the next WG meeting in September. The purpose of the September working group will be: **(b) (5)**

WG3 – Preparing Our Citizens for an AI Future (Griffiths, Work, Mark, Clyburn)

The group is collaborating with the DIB and the JAIC to develop a common draft workforce framework, to be discussed during the next WG meeting on September 9. In recent weeks WG staff have engaged with the Army Cyber Institute, Google's recruiting and workforce training teams, the Navy's personnel office, DARPA's HR office, and the Hill.

WG4 – International Cooperation and Competitiveness in AI (Matheny, Darby, Louie)

The group is beginning to **(b) (5)**, and is planning for two September meetings. On September 16 the group will focus on **(b) (5)**. The group will also host a joint meeting with the Special Project on public-private partnerships.

SP / Partnerships – The Special Project on public-private partnerships held a series of discussions at the Naval Surface Warfare Center Crane, in Indiana, on July 8. The SOC from that session is available [here](#). Next, the project will host a joint session with WG4 in September, **(b) (5)**.

SP / Ethics – **(b) (5)**

(b) (5) . This research has included engagements with IDA, Google, DIB, and CNAS. The Special Project's first meeting will be in September.

SP / Data – A proposed framework for the Special Project on Data is attached [here](#) for commissioner review and comment. The goal is to assess the role of data for AI in each of the four Working Groups. A one-day workshop is tentatively planned for September 17, 18, or 19 in DC. Please contact (b) (6) if you have comments on the framework or if you are interested in being involved with the project (b) (6) .

3—Outreach and Engagement

In the last few weeks, NSCAI staff members have engaged with DARPA, NSF, OSD R&E, Navy Staff, Shield AI, CNAS, Oxford, Arizona State, House Appropriations, Kennedy School, JAIC, DIB, Google, the UK Embassy . . . and many others.

We are tracking staff engagements in a spreadsheet linked [here](#).

4—Additional Items

War on the Rocks: A call for papers was [published](#) on July 18, signed by the NSCAI Chair and Vice Chair, under the title, "In Search of Ideas: The National Security Commission on AI Wants You." As we receive submissions we will review them and share articles of interest with commissioners.

Hill Activity: On July 16, Congress held three major hearings on policy, legal, and regulatory questions surrounding big U.S. tech firms -- in the House Judiciary Antitrust Subcommittee (testimony [here](#)), the Senate Judiciary Constitution Subcommittee (focused on Google, [here](#)), and the Senate Banking Committee (focused on Facebook, [here](#)).

Please let us know if you need anything from us.

Ylli

Subject: NSCAI Initial Report Submission to Congress
Date: Wednesday, July 31, 2019 at 9:04:32 AM Eastern Daylight Time
From: Tara Rigler (b) (6)
To: Eric Schmidt (b) (6), Robert Work (b) (6),
Safra Catz, (b)(6), Steve Chien, (b)(6),
Steve Chien, (b)(6), Mignon Clyburn, (b)(6),
Chris Darby, (b)(6), Ken Ford, (b)(6),
Jose-Marie Griffiths, (b)(6), Eric Horvitz, (b)(6),
Eric Horvitz, (b)(6), Andy Jassy, (b)(6), Gilman Louie (b)(6),
Gilman Louie, (b)(6), William Mark, (b)(6),
Jason Matheny, (b)(6), Katharina McFarland, (b)(6),
Katharina McFarland, (b)(6), Andrew Moore, (b)(6)
CC: NSCAI Staff, (b)(6), NSCAI Commissioners, (b)(6)
Attachments: NSCAI Initial Report Talking Points July 31, 2019.docx, NSCAI_Initial Report to Congress_July 2019.pdf, Press Release July 31 Initial Report to Congress Final.docx

Dear Commissioners,

Please find attached the signed initial report submitted to Congress this morning at 9 a.m., the press release with a link to the report that will be released at 10 a.m., and talking points to use if you are asked about the report. The report can also be accessed on www.nscai.gov under the "About" tab or through the link in the press release. Please let me know if you have any questions.

Many thanks,

Tara

--

Tara M. Rigler
Director, Strategy, Communications and Engagements
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence
(b) (6)

Subject: NSCAI Status Update - Special Edition

Date: Friday, August 2, 2019 at 11:26:53 AM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Yll Bajraktari

To: Eric Schmidt, Robert Work, Safra Catz, Steve Chien, Mignon Clyburn, Chris Darby, Kenneth Ford, José Marie Griffiths, Eric Horvitz, **Andy Jassy, (b)(6)**, Gilman Louie, William Mark, Jason Matheny, Katharina McFarland, Andrew Moore

CC: **NSCAI Staff, (b)(6), NSCAI Commissioners, (b)(6)**

Dear Commissioners,

For our status update this week, we would like to bring your attention to two items:

- 1) A draft outstanding "framework beliefs" document prepared by **NSCAI Staff Members (b)(6)** for your review this month, and
- 2) Media and Hill reaction to our Initial Report, released July 31

1—NSCAI Draft "Framework Beliefs"

About this document:

- This "framework beliefs" document is in response to the Chair's request at the July 11 plenary for a shared, working draft that articulates, in bullet form, "what the group currently believes to be true."
- It is a series of assertions that can help us refine our focus and incorporate your ideas. It is intended to assess the current state of play, not provide recommendations (though some points lean in that direction).
- It contains claims and judgments only, and does not currently have supporting explanation, analysis, or evidence. With your feedback, we can develop this further into a more refined framework for the November report.

****We would greatly appreciate your substantive feedback and comments on the [draft document attached here](#). Please review by Sept 1, and feel free to write directly on the document or send us your comments by email.****

ADMIN NOTE: To access the document, you must use your NSCAI account. If you have any trouble please let us know.

At the same time, Working Groups are preparing research memos for you to review and discuss at the September WG meetings. These are important for generating more "meat" for the report, and we ask you to engage closely with your WG staff leads on the memos this month and next.

2—Reaction to the Initial Report

Thanks to Tara and **(b)(6)** we had a great success submitting our first report to Congress and conducting some media attention.

We released our Initial Report to Congress and more widely at 9am on July 31, and posted it on our new website (www.nscai.gov).

Media: Three media stories about the report have been published as of August 2 – by [National Defense Magazine](#), [Defense News/C4ISR.Net](#), and [Inside Defense](#) (behind a paywall).

Reporting was straightforward, and drew accurately from the press release and report language, as well as from a limited media engagement led by Vice Chair Bob Work on July 31.

Hill: We have received positive initial feedback from the House and Senate Armed Services Committees, and from the Senate Select Committee on Intelligence. Committee staff members also expressed an eagerness for our recommendations.

Please let us know if you have any questions or would like more info.

Ylli

Subject: NSCAI - Status Update

Date: Monday, August 19, 2019 at 2:17:38 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Yll Bajraktari

To: Eric Schmidt, Andrew Moore, Eric Horvitz, Safra Catz, Katharina McFarland, Steve Chien, Kenneth Ford, José Marie Griffiths, Mignon Clyburn, Robert Work, Darby, Chris, Jason Matheny, Gilman Louie, **Andy Jassy, (b)(6)**, William Mark

CC: **NSCAI Commissioners, (b)(6)**, **NSCAI Staff, (b)(6)**

Dear Commissioners,

Hope you all are enjoying August and getting ready for September. We will have four working groups and three special projects meetings next month, while drafting the interim report - busy month!

Below is a status update prepared by **NSCAI Staff Member (b)(6)** across all of our efforts:

1. Requests on Framework Beliefs and WG Research Memos
2. Data Special Project workshop invitation
3. Working Group / Special Project updates
4. Outreach and engagement
5. Additional items

1—Framework Beliefs Doc & WG Research Memos

Framework Beliefs: A reminder to **please review and comment** (either in the shared doc itself, [linked here](#), or by email) **before Sept 1**. If you have any difficulty accessing the document, please contact Mike Gable **(b)(6)**.

WG Research Memos: Each Working Group is preparing a memo that aims to capture what the group has learned so far. These will be distributed ahead of the September WG meetings. **Please engage with your WG staff lead to provide input.**

2—Data Special Project Update/Request

Workshop: The Special Project on Data is planning a one-day "AI Data and Infrastructure Workshop" to further develop strategic priorities related to data for AI. **You are invited to attend on Sept 18 at the NSCAI offices** (unclassified).

The goal of the event is to illuminate ways to improve the USG's AI-relevant data holdings. (A draft agenda is [linked here](#).) The staff is working to identify and invite experts. Thank you for the suggestions we've received so far, and we welcome more. If you are available to attend on Sept 18, please contact **NSCAI Staff Member (b)(6)**.

3—Working Group / Special Project Updates

WG1 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI Research (Moore, Schmidt, Horvitz)

The group continues to **(b)(5)**. The group's Sept 26 meeting in DC will **(b)(5)**. [\(Draft agenda here\)](#)

WG2 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI National Security Applications (Catz, Ford, McFarland, Jassy, Chien)

WG2 is continuing to **(b)(5)** in preparation for the group's Sept 9 meeting in DC. That meeting will **(b)(5)**. The staff is also visiting Service and academic labs and research centers. [\(Draft agenda here\)](#)

WG3 – Preparing Our Citizens for an AI Future (Griffiths, Work, Mark, Clyburn)

The group's next meeting on Sept 9 will **(b)(5)**. The group is continuing to work with the DIB and the JAIC to develop a shared workforce framework for review at the next meeting. Staff has engaged recently with Navy, CNAS, OSD/P&R, and other DoD officials. [\(Draft agenda here\)](#)

WG4 – International Cooperation and Competitiveness in AI (Matheny, Darby, Louie)

WG4 will hold its next meeting on Sept 16, which will **(b)(5)**. [\(Draft agenda here\)](#)

SP / Partnerships – The special project will host a joint meeting with WG4 in September, (b) (5) . (Draft agenda here.) The project is also (b) (5) .

SP / Ethics – The first special project meeting is tentatively scheduled for late September. It will (b) (5) (Draft agenda here.) Recently, staff members have engaged with a wide range of USG components, and with Harvard, MIT, Cal Poly, and others.

4—Outreach and Engagement

Hill engagement: Before the August recess, staff met with House AI Caucus Co-Chair Rep. Jerry McNerney (D-CA) to update him on the Commission's work. (b) (5) (Full readout here)

****Note:** If you speak with Members of Congress, please mention the Commission's upcoming conference on Nov 5. We would welcome their attendance. And if you have reason to be on Capitol Hill, please let us know if you have free time to meet with Members on Commission business. We are happy to coordinate meetings. **

Recent staff engagements have included DHS, DOE, Army Research Lab, Wilson Center, OSD/P&R, Canadian Embassy, Data & Society, Naval War College, State Department, Google, General Dynamics, Raytheon . . . and many others.

We are tracking staff engagements in a spreadsheet [linked here](#).

5—Additional Items

War on the Rocks: The first article in response to our call for ideas was posted on Aug 16. Eric Lofgren, "A Guide to Not Killing or Mutilating AI Research," [linked here](#).

NSF Memo: On July 11, the National Science Foundation issued a policy on "Foreign Government Talent Recruitment Programs," [linked here](#).

Wash Post article: The Post published an article on Aug 19 describing how "Chinese scientists are at the forefront of the quantum revolution," [linked here](#).

Please let us know if you need anything from us.

Ylli

Subject: Fwd: NSCAI - Status Update
Date: Tuesday, September 3, 2019 at 3:59:45 AM Eastern Daylight Time
From: Yll Bajraktari (b) (6)
To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6), NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Attachments: 9-2-19 NSCAI Framework Beliefs - Commissioners-aj.docx

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Jassy, Andrew (b) (6) >
Date: Mon, Sep 2, 2019 at 23:23
Subject: RE: NSCAI - Status Update
To: Yll Bajraktari (b) (6)
CC: Andy Jassy - Support Staff, (b)(6)

[See attached for several comments](#)

From: Yll Bajraktari (b) (6) >
Sent: Monday, August 19, 2019 11:18 AM
To: Eric Schmidt (b) (6) >; Andrew Moore (b) (6) >; Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>; Safra Catz (b) (6) >; Katharina Mcfarland (b) (6) >; Steve Chien (b) (6) >; Kenneth Ford (b) (6) >; José Marie Griffiths (b) (6) >; Mignon Clyburn (b) (6) >; Robert Work <(b) (6)>; Darby, Chris (b) (6) >; Jason Matheny (b) (6) >; Gilman Louie (b) (6) >; Jassy, Andrew (b) (6) >; William Mark (b) (6) >
Cc: NSCAI Commissioners, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff, (b)(6)
Subject: NSCAI - Status Update

Dear Commissioners,

Hope you all are enjoying August and getting ready for September. We will have four working groups and three special projects meetings next month, while drafting the interim report - busy month!

Below is a status update prepared by NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6) across all of our efforts:

1. Requests on Framework Beliefs and WG Research Memos
2. Data Special Project workshop invitation

3. Working Group / Special Project updates
4. Outreach and engagement
5. Additional items

1—Framework Beliefs Doc & WG Research Memos

Framework Beliefs: A reminder to **please review and comment** (either in the shared doc itself, [linked here](#), or by email) **before Sept 1**. If you have any difficulty accessing the document, please contact Mike Gable (b) (6)

WG Research Memos: Each Working Group is preparing a memo that aims to capture what the group has learned so far. These will be distributed ahead of the September WG meetings. **Please engage with your WG staff lead to provide input.**

2—Data Special Project Update/Request

Workshop: The Special Project on Data is planning a one-day "AI Data and Infrastructure Workshop" to further develop strategic priorities related to data for AI. **You are invited to attend on Sept 18 at the NSCAI offices** (unclassified).

The goal of the event is to illuminate ways to improve the USG's AI-relevant data holdings. (A draft agenda is [linked here](#).) The staff is working to identify and invite experts. Thank you for the suggestions we've received so far, and we welcome more. If you are available to attend on Sept 18, please contact NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)).

3—Working Group / Special Project Updates

WG1 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI Research (Moore, Schmidt, Horvitz)

The group continues to (b) (5)

. The group's Sept 26 meeting in DC will (b) (5)

([Draft agenda here](#))

WG2 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI National Security Applications (Catz, Ford, McFarland, Jassy, Chien)

WG2 is continuing to (b) (5) in preparation for the group's Sept 9 meeting in DC. That meeting will (b) (5). The staff is also visiting Service and academic labs and research centers. ([Draft agenda here](#))

WG3 – Preparing Our Citizens for an AI Future (Griffiths, Work, Mark, Clyburn)

The group's next meeting on Sept 9 will (b) (5). The group is continuing to work with the DIB and the JAIC to develop a shared workforce framework for review at the next meeting. Staff has engaged recently with Navy, CNAS, OSD/P&R, and other DoD officials. ([Draft agenda here](#))

WG4 – International Cooperation and Competitiveness in AI (Matheny, Darby, Louie)

WG4 will hold its next meeting on Sept 16, which will (b) (5). ([Draft agenda here](#))

SP / Partnerships – The special project will host a joint meeting with WG4 in September, focused on (b) (5). ([Draft agenda here](#).) The project is also (b) (5).

SP / Ethics – The first special project meeting is tentatively scheduled for late September. It will (b) (5). ([Draft agenda here](#).) Recently, staff members have engaged with a wide range of USG components, and with Harvard, MIT, Cal Poly, and others.

4—Outreach and Engagement

Hill engagement: Before the August recess, staff met with House AI Caucus Co-Chair Rep. Jerry McNerney (D-CA) to update him on the Commission's work. (b) (5). ([Full readout here](#))

****Note:** If you speak with Members of Congress, please mention the Commission's upcoming conference on Nov 5.

We would welcome their attendance. And if you have reason to be on Capitol Hill, please let us know if you have free time to meet with Members on Commission business. We are happy to coordinate meetings.**

Recent staff engagements have included DHS, DOE, Army Research Lab, Wilson Center, OSD/P&R, Canadian Embassy, Data & Society, Naval War College, State Department, Google, General Dynamics, Raytheon . . . and many others.

We are tracking staff engagements in a spreadsheet [linked here](#).

5—Additional Items

War on the Rocks: The first article in response to our call for ideas was posted on Aug 16. Eric Lofgren, "A Guide to Not Killing or Mutilating AI Research," [linked here](#).

NSF Memo: On July 11, the National Science Foundation issued a policy on "Foreign Government Talent Recruitment Programs," [linked here](#).

Wash Post article: The Post published an article on Aug 19 describing how "Chinese scientists are at the forefront of the quantum revolution," [linked here](#).

Please let us know if you need anything from us.

Ylli

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

MEMO

WHO: Meeting with House AI Caucus Co-Chair Rep. Jerry McNerney (D-CA)
NSCAI: NSCAI Staff Members, (b)(6)
WHEN: July 26, 2019 at 10:00am
WHERE: 2265 Rayburn HOB
RE: NSCAI progress and gathering the Congressman's AI priorities

BLUF: The Congressman was excited to meet with Commission staff and looks forward to the Commission's recommendations. He believes Congress must be educated on AI in national security and asked for help educating his caucus, congressional staff, and the Congress at large.

Summary:

(b) (5)

Deliverables:

- Remain in touch and gather feedback on the Commission's work.
- Share (b) (6)'s AI 101 slide deck and introduce Rep. McNerney to (b) (6) for an AI Caucus briefing (done).