

Subject: Re: For Review: NSCAI WG1 draft agenda for May 8
Date: Friday, April 26, 2019 at 10:01:04 AM Eastern Daylight Time
From: Eric Horvitz
To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Thanks!

From: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Sent: Friday, April 26, 2019 9:58:53 AM
To: Eric Schmidt; Eric Horvitz; Andrew Moore
Cc: Yll Bajraktari; NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6); Michael Gable; Eric Schmidt Support Staff, (b)(6); Andrew Moore Support Staff, (b)(6); Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); Eric Schmidt Support, (b)(6)
Subject: For Review: NSCAI WG1 draft agenda for May 8

Dr. Schmidt and Dr. Horvitz,

I hope this finds you well! Following identification of a date and time for the working group's first meeting on May 8th, we've built out a draft agenda along the lines of the concept previously shared, albeit scaled down to fit within the two hour time slot we have.

Dr. Moore has had the opportunity to review, and I've attached it here for your additional feedback. We are ready and available to connect for a quick phone call in the coming days to discuss in greater detail, should you be interested to do so.

You'll see that we've set up the afternoon to open with a brief scene setter capturing the broad trends in US/China/Europe AI research landscapes from the authors of the AI Index (specific briefer TBD). We've asked them to also draw out the implications of these trends for US policy and highlight where there are deficiencies in data that, if addressed, could improve decision-making and prioritization. This snapshot will be followed by a presentation on the US academic community's proposed response to this landscape: the 20-year AI Research Roadmap for the U.S. developed by CRA Computing Community Consortium and AAAI. We would then close this portion of the agenda with a discussion with both briefers.

The second section of the agenda will focus specifically on DoD investment in AI research and development, featuring analysis from a private sector firm, Govini, who has done some compelling data analysis around how much, in which issue areas and with who the DoD has focused its investments in AI.

Finally, we'll close with executive time to discuss the issues you would like to bring to the plenary session on May 20, the hard questions identified from the afternoon's briefings to take forward for further assessment, and a framework around which to organize the working group's efforts going forward.

Again, we stand ready to arrange a call to talk through any of the above at your convenience or refine further via email collaboration.

Respectfully,

(b) (6)

NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Director, Research and Analysis
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: Re: For Review: NSCAI WG1 draft agenda for May 8

Date: Friday, April 26, 2019 at 10:03:10 AM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6), Eric Schmidt, Andrew Moore

CC: Yll Bajraktari, NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6), Michael Gable, Eric Schmidt Support Staff (b)(6), Andrew Moore Support Staff (b)(6), Eric Horvitz Support Staff (b)(6), (b) (6) office

Thanks. Looking forward to the meeting.

From: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Sent: Friday, April 26, 2019 9:59 AM

To: Eric Schmidt; Eric Horvitz; Andrew Moore

Cc: Yll Bajraktari, NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6); Michael Gable, Eric Schmidt Support Staff, (b)(6), Andrew Moore Support Staff (b)(6), Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6), Eric Schmidt Support, (b)(6)

Subject: For Review: NSCAI WG1 draft agenda for May 8

Dr. Schmidt and Dr. Horvitz,

I hope this finds you well! Following identification of a date and time for the working group's first meeting on May 8th, we've built out a draft agenda along the lines of the concept previously shared, albeit scaled down to fit within the two hour time slot we have.

Dr. Moore has had the opportunity to review, and I've attached it here for your additional feedback. We are ready and available to connect for a quick phone call in the coming days to discuss in greater detail, should you be interested to do so.

You'll see that we've set up the afternoon to open with a brief scene setter capturing the broad trends in US/China/Europe AI research landscapes from the authors of the AI Index (specific briefer TBD). We've asked them to also draw out the implications of these trends for US policy and highlight where there are deficiencies in data that, if addressed, could improve decision-making and prioritization. This snapshot will be followed by a presentation on the US academic community's proposed response to this landscape: the 20-year AI Research Roadmap for the U.S. developed by CRA Computing Community Consortium and AAAI. We would then close this portion of the agenda with a discussion with both briefers.

The second section of the agenda will focus specifically on DoD investment in AI research and development, featuring analysis from a private sector firm, Govini, who has done some compelling data analysis around how much, in which issue areas and with who the DoD has focused its investments in AI.

Finally, we'll close with executive time to discuss the issues you would like to bring to the plenary session on May 20, the hard questions identified from the afternoon's briefings to take forward for further assessment, and a framework around which to organize the working group's efforts going forward.

Again, we stand ready to arrange a call to talk through any of the above at your convenience or refine further via email collaboration.

Respectfully,

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

Director, Research and Analysis

National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: RE: Urgent

Date: Monday, May 13, 2019 at 5:12:59 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: Yll Bajraktari

CC: Michael Gable, Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6), NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Thanks. (b) (6) is on the email. I'm on a plane to DC. This sounds great.

(b) (6): Can you work through to identify exactly the information that is needed?

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>

Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 2:01 PM

To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>

Cc: Michael Gable <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Subject: Re: Urgent

We just checked with our security office and your clearance may be able to be reinstated fairly easily. To initiate the process, I need you to submit a portion of your package so HR can start the action. Specifically, we will need the OF-306 and SF-144. Please ask (b) (6) to call Mike asap at (b) (6).

Thank you!

Ylli

On May 13, 2019, at 4:43 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Eric Horvitz, (b)(6) – it is not active at this time. I asked to remove it when I didn't have a business need over a year ago. We'll get the paperwork in asap.

Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>

Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 1:42:14 PM

To: Eric Horvitz

Cc: Michael Gable; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Subject: Re: Urgent

We don't have anything about you so if you have an active clearance that's great. We just need your SSN to pull it from this end - at least for Monday. The rest we can complete after May 20th.

On May 13, 2019, at 4:33 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

(b) (6) is lead on the paperwork, and it's my understanding that she's nearly done. I would hope it would be a bit easier than for a new case, per my recent clearance.

Eric

From: Yli Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 1:12:57 PM
To: Eric Horvitz
Cc: Michael Gable; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)
Subject: Urgent

Mr. Horvitz,

We are in the last stages of preparations for the plenary meeting of all Commissioners on May 20th (next Monday). In order to proceed with your access to the meetings, we need to finish your on-boarding paper. Can you please put us in touch with someone that can help with this issue? We need to formally bring you and your clearance on board as part of the Congressional requirement.

I thank you in advance for any help you can provide in this matter.

Best,

Ylli

--

*This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission **of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI. *

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: RE: Urgent

Date: Monday, May 13, 2019 at 6:49:18 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: Michael Gable

CC: Yll Bajraktari, Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6), NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

I have had no paid Federal jobs. If no paid jobs, I assume you will not need the form. Correct?

I will send a photo of my passport shortly.

Eric

From: Michael Gable <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 3:36 PM
To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>
Cc: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Subject: Re: Urgent

Eric,

The OF-306 you completed will work. For the SF-144, you are only required to list periods of federal service that would count toward length of service and other payroll types of actions. You are not required to list any unpaid/voluntary service on boards and commissions as well. If you could provide the federal board and commissions on which you currently serve, it would help us as we need to ensure that you do not exceed the total service time limitations on consultants (generally 130 days per year).

Please let me know if you have additional questions.

If you could also provide a copy of your passport, we should be able to complete the remainder of the forms necessary to initiate the HR process and acquire your clearance.

Thank you,
Mike

MICHAEL GABLE
Chief of Staff
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence
(b) (6)
(b) (6)

On May 13, 2019, at 6:08 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

I found this OF-306 form while flying. Will this do?

I also found SF-144. For that form, can you clarify what is included in Prior Federal Service?

I currently serve on the Board of Regents of the National Library of Medicine (NLM, an NIH Institute). Shall I assume this current (non-paying) position counts as prior Federal Service?

I have served on the Naval Research Advisory Committee (NRAC) from 2003-2006. Should that be included as well. Again, a non-paying scientific advisory board position.

On
Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 2:01 PM
To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>
Cc: Michael Gable <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
<NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)>
Subject: Re: Urgent

We just checked with our security office and your clearance may be able to be reinstated fairly easily. To initiate the process, I need you to submit a portion of your package so HR can start the action. Specifically, we will need the OF-306 and SF-144. Please ask (b) (6) to call Mike asap at (b) (6).

Thank you!
Ylli

On May 13, 2019, at 4:43 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Eric Horvitz, (b)(6) – it is not active at this time. I asked to remove it when I didn't have a business need over a year ago. We'll get the paperwork in asap.

Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 1:42:14 PM
To: Eric Horvitz
Cc: Michael Gable; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Subject: Re: Urgent

We don't have anything about you so if you have an active clearance that's great. We just need your SSN to pull it from this end - at least for Monday. The rest we can complete after May 20th.

On May 13, 2019, at 4:33 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

(b) (6) is lead on the paperwork, and it's my understanding that she's nearly done. I would hope it would be a bit easier than for a new case, per my recent clearance.

Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 1:12:57 PM
To: Eric Horvitz
Cc: Michael Gable; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)
Subject: Urgent

Mr. Horvitz,

We are in the last stages of preparations for the plenary meeting of all Commissioners on May 20th (next Monday). In order to proceed with your access to the meetings, we need to finish your on-boarding paper. Can you please put us in touch with someone that can help with this issue? We need to formally bring you and your clearance on board as part of the Congressional requirement.

I thank you in advance for any help you can provide in this matter.

Best,

Ylli

--

*This message is private and may contain confidential information or other

matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission **of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI. *

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

<OF-306.pdf>

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: RE: Urgent
Date: Monday, May 13, 2019 at 7:04:13 PM Eastern Daylight Time
From: Eric Horvitz
To: Michael Gable
CC: Yll Bajraktari, Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6), NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Attachments: Eric_Horvitz_pport.jpg

Here you go.

From: Michael Gable <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 3:36 PM
To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>
Cc: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Subject: Re: Urgent

Eric,

The OF-306 you completed will work. For the SF-144, you are only required to list periods of federal service that would count toward length of service and other payroll types of actions. You are not required to list any unpaid/voluntary service on boards and commissions as well. If you could provide the federal board and commissions on which you currently serve, it would help us as we need to ensure that you do not exceed the total service time limitations on consultants (generally 130 days per year).

Please let me know if you have additional questions.

If you could also provide a copy of your passport, we should be able to compete the remainder of the forms necessary to initiate the HR process and acquire your clearance.

Thank you,
Mike

MICHAEL GABLE
Chief of Staff
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence
(b) (6)
(b) (6)

On May 13, 2019, at 6:08 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

I found this OF-306 form while flying. Will this do?

I also found SF-144. For that form, can you clarify what is included in Prior Federal Service?

I currently serve on the Board of Regents of the National Library of Medicine (NLM, an NIH Institute). Shall I assume this current (non-paying) position counts as prior Federal Service?

I have served on the Naval Research Advisory Committee (NRAC) from 2003-2006. Should that be included as well. Again, a non-paying scientific advisory board position.

On
Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 2:01 PM
To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>
Cc: Michael Gable <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
<NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)>
Subject: Re: Urgent

We just checked with our security office and your clearance may be able to be reinstated fairly easily. To initiate the process, I need you to submit a portion of your package so HR can start the action. Specifically, we will need the OF-306 and SF-144. Please ask (b) (6) to call Mike asap at (b) (6).

Thank you!
Ylli

On May 13, 2019, at 4:43 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Eric Horvitz, (b)(6) – it is not active at this time. I asked to remove it when I didn't have a business need over a year ago. We'll get the paperwork in asap.

Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 1:42:14 PM
To: Eric Horvitz
Cc: Michael Gable; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Subject: Re: Urgent

We don't have anything about you so if you have an active clearance that's great. We just need your SSN to pull it from this end - at least for Monday. The rest we can complete after May 20th.

On May 13, 2019, at 4:33 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

(b) (6) is lead on the paperwork, and it's my understanding that she's nearly done. I would hope it would be a bit easier than for a new case, per my recent clearance.

Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 1:12:57 PM
To: Eric Horvitz
Cc: Michael Gable; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)
Subject: Urgent

Mr. Horvitz,

We are in the last stages of preparations for the plenary meeting of all Commissioners on May 20th (next Monday). In order to proceed with your access to the meetings, we need to finish your on-boarding paper. Can you please put us in touch with someone that can help with this issue? We need to formally bring you and your clearance on board as part of the Congressional requirement.

I thank you in advance for any help you can provide in this matter.

Best,

Ylli

--

*This message is private and may contain confidential information or other

matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission **of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI. *

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

<OF-306.pdf>

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: RE: Urgent
Date: Monday, May 13, 2019 at 7:14:34 PM Eastern Daylight Time
From: Eric Horvitz
To: Michael Gable
CC: Yll Bajraktari, [REDACTED], [REDACTED]
Attachments: sf144_Eric_Horvitz_signed.pdf

Finally, here is my signed SF-144 form.

From: Eric Horvitz
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 4:04 PM
To: Michael Gable <[REDACTED]>
Cc: Yll Bajraktari <[REDACTED]>; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Subject: RE: Urgent

Here you go.

From: Michael Gable <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 3:36 PM
To: Eric Horvitz <[REDACTED]>
Cc: Yll Bajraktari <[REDACTED]>; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Subject: Re: Urgent

Eric,

The OF-306 you completed will work. For the SF-144, you are only required to list periods of federal service that would count toward length of service and other payroll types of actions. You are not required to list any unpaid/voluntary service on boards and commissions as well. If you could provide the federal board and commissions on which you currently serve, it would help us as we need to ensure that you do not exceed the total service time limitations on consultants (generally 130 days per year).

Please let me know if you have additional questions.

If you could also provide a copy of your passport, we should be able to complete the remainder of the forms necessary to initiate the HR process and acquire your clearance.

Thank you,
Mike

MICHAEL GABLE
Chief of Staff
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

On May 13, 2019, at 6:08 PM, Eric Horvitz <[REDACTED]> wrote:

I found this OF-306 form while flying. Will this do?

I also found SF-144. For that form, can you clarify what is included in Prior Federal Service?

I currently serve on the Board of Regents of the National Library of Medicine (NLM, an NIH Institute). Shall I assume this current (non-paying) position counts as prior Federal Service?

I have served on the Naval Research Advisory Committee (NRAC) from 2003-2006. Should that be included as well. Again, a non-paying scientific advisory board position.

On
Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 2:01 PM
To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>
Cc: Michael Gable <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Subject: Re: Urgent

We just checked with our security office and your clearance may be able to be reinstated fairly easily. To initiate the process, I need you to submit a portion of your package so HR can start the action. Specifically, we will need the OF-306 and SF-144. Please ask (b) (6) to call Mike asap at (b) (6).

Thank you!
Ylli

On May 13, 2019, at 4:43 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Eric Horvitz, (b)(6) – it is not active at this time. I asked to remove it when I didn't have a business need over a year ago. We'll get the paperwork in asap.

Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 1:42:14 PM
To: Eric Horvitz
Cc: Michael Gable; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Subject: Re: Urgent

We don't have anything about you so if you have an active clearance that's great. We just need your SSN to pull it from this end - at least for Monday. The rest we can complete after May 20th.

On May 13, 2019, at 4:33 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

(b) (6) is lead on the paperwork, and it's my understanding that she's nearly done. I would hope it would be a bit easier than for a new case, per my recent clearance.

Eric

From: Ylli Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 1:12:57 PM
To: Eric Horvitz
Cc: Michael Gable; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)
Subject: Urgent

Mr. Horvitz,

We are in the last stages of preparations for the plenary meeting of all Commissioners on May 20th (next Monday). In order to proceed with your access to the meetings, we need to finish your on-boarding paper. Can you please put us in touch with someone that can help with this issue? We need to formally bring you and your clearance on board as part of the Congressional requirement.

I thank you in advance for any help you can provide in this matter.

Best,

Ylli

--

*This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission **of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI. *

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

<OF-306.pdf>

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: RE: Urgent

Date: Wednesday, May 15, 2019 at 1:37:49 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: Yll Bajraktari

CC: Mike Gable, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6); Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)

Okay,thanks.

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>

Sent: Wednesday, May 15, 2019 10:35 AM

To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>

Cc: Mike Gable, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6); Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)

Subject: Re: Urgent

Eric,

Unfortunately, the classified location we are using has a limited seating. We will prepare all the notes for you and other Commissioners.

Sorry about that.

Ylli

On May 15, 2019, at 1:33 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Mike,

Another question: I have an assistant with a clearance ((b) (6)). Might she come if she's available on Monday (e.g., to capture notes, to do's etc.). If so, what would you need from her around clearance. I could put her directly in touch with you.

Eric

From: Mike Gable, (b)(6)

Sent: Wednesday, May 15, 2019 8:58 AM

To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>

Cc: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6); Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)

Subject: Re: Urgent

Eric,

We have everything we need. We're pushing it through the process now. You should expect to have an early start on Monday to get read back in. We'll send details after we get confirmation that you are good to go.

Thank you,

Mike

Sent from my iPhone

On May 15, 2019, at 11:54 AM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Are we all set?

Thanks,

Eric

From: Michael Gable <(b) (6)>

Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 3:36 PM

To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>

Cc: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); (b) (6)
NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Subject: Re: Urgent

Eric,

The OF-306 you completed will work. For the SF-144, you are only required to list periods of federal service that would count toward length of service and other payroll types of actions. You are not required to list any unpaid/voluntary service on boards and commissions as well. If you could provide the federal board and commissions on which you currently serve, it would help us as we need to ensure that you do not exceed the total service time limitations on consultants (generally 130 days per year).

Please let me know if you have additional questions.

If you could also provide a copy of your passport, we should be able to complete the remainder of the forms necessary to initiate the HR process and acquire your clearance.

Thank you,

Mike

MICHAEL GABLE
Chief of Staff
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

On May 13, 2019, at 6:08 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

I found this OF-306 form while flying. Will this do?

I also found SF-144. For that form, can you clarify what is included in

Prior Federal Service?

I currently serve on the Board of Regents of the National Library of Medicine (NLM, an NIH Institute). Shall I assume this current (non-paying) position counts as prior Federal Service?

I have served on the Naval Research Advisory Committee (NRAC) from 2003-2006. Should that be included as well. Again, a non-paying scientific advisory board position.

On
Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 2:01 PM
To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>
Cc: Michael Gable <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)
<(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Subject: Re: Urgent

We just checked with our security office and your clearance may be able to be reinstated fairly easily. To initiate the process, I need you to submit a portion of your package so HR can start the action. Specifically, we will need the OF-306 and SF-144. Please ask (b) (6) to call Mike asap at (b) (6)

Thank you!
Ylli

On May 13, 2019, at 4:43 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Eric Horvitz, (b)(6) – it is not active at this time. I asked to remove it when I didn't have a business need over a year ago. We'll get the paperwork in asap.

Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 1:42:14 PM
To: Eric Horvitz
Cc: Michael Gable; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Subject: Re: Urgent

We don't have anything about you so if you have an active clearance that's great. We just need your SSN to pull it from this end - at least for Monday. The rest we can complete after May 20th.

On May 13, 2019, at 4:33 PM, Eric Horvitz
<(b) (6)> wrote:

(b) (6) is lead on the paperwork, and it's my understanding that she's nearly done. I would hope it would be a bit easier than for a new case, per my recent clearance.

Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 1:12:57 PM
To: Eric Horvitz
Cc: Michael Gable; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)
Subject: Urgent

Mr. Horvitz,

We are in the last stages of preparations for the plenary meeting of all Commissioners on May 20th (next Monday). In order to proceed with your access to the meetings, we need to finish your on-boarding paper. Can you please put us in touch with someone that can help with this issue? We need to formally bring you and your clearance on board as part of the Congressional requirement.

I thank you in advance for any help you can provide in this matter.

Best,

Ylli

--

*This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission **of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI. *

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

<OF-306.pdf>

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: RE: Urgent

Date: Wednesday, May 15, 2019 at 12:15:57 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: Mike Gable, (b)(6)

CC: Yll Bajraktari, NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6), Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)

Happy to do that early in the am. Thanks.

From: Mike Gable, (b)(6)

Sent: Wednesday, May 15, 2019 8:58 AM

To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>

Cc: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6); Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)

Subject: Re: Urgent

Eric,

We have everything we need. We're pushing it through the process now. You should expect to have an early start on Monday to get read back in. We'll send details after we get confirmation that you are good to go.

Thank you,

Mike

Sent from my iPhone

On May 15, 2019, at 11:54 AM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Are we all set?

Thanks,

Eric

From: Michael Gable <(b) (6)>

Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 3:36 PM

To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>

Cc: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Subject: Re: Urgent

Eric,

The OF-306 you completed will work. For the SF-144, you are only required to list periods of federal service that would count toward length of service and other payroll types of actions. You are not required to list any unpaid/voluntary service on boards and commissions as well. If you could provide the federal board and commissions on which you currently serve, it would help us as we need to ensure that you do not exceed the total service time limitations on consultants (generally 130 days per year).

Please let me know if you have additional questions.

If you could also provide a copy of your passport, we should be able to complete the remainder of the forms necessary to initiate the HR process and acquire your clearance.

Thank you,
Mike

MICHAEL GABLE
Chief of Staff
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

On May 13, 2019, at 6:08 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

I found this OF-306 form while flying. Will this do?

I also found SF-144. For that form, can you clarify what is included in Prior Federal Service?

I currently serve on the Board of Regents of the National Library of Medicine (NLM, an NIH Institute). Shall I assume this current (non-paying) position counts as prior Federal Service?

I have served on the Naval Research Advisory Committee (NRAC) from 2003-2006. Should that be included as well. Again, a non-paying scientific advisory board position.

On
Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 2:01 PM
To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>
Cc: Michael Gable <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Subject: Re: Urgent

We just checked with our security office and your clearance may be able to be reinstated fairly easily. To initiate the process, I need you to submit a portion of your package so HR can start the action. Specifically, we will need the OF-306 and SF-144. Please ask (b) (6) to call Mike asap at (b) (6).

Thank you!
Ylli

On May 13, 2019, at 4:43 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Eric Horvitz, (b)(6) – it is not active at this time. I asked to remove it when I didn't have a business need over a year ago. We'll get the paperwork in asap.

Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 1:42:14 PM
To: Eric Horvitz
Cc: Michael Gable; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Subject: Re: Urgent

We don't have anything about you so if you have an active clearance that's great. We just need your SSN to pull it from this end - at least for Monday. The rest we can complete after May 20th.

On May 13, 2019, at 4:33 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

(b) (6) is lead on the paperwork, and it's my understanding that she's nearly done. I would hope it would be a bit easier than for a new case, per my recent clearance.

Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Sent: Monday, May 13, 2019 1:12:57 PM
To: Eric Horvitz
Cc: Michael Gable; Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)
Subject: Urgent

Mr. Horvitz,

We are in the last stages of preparations for the plenary meeting of all Commissioners on May 20th (next Monday). In order to proceed with your access to the meetings, we need to finish your on-

boarding paper. Can you please put us in touch with someone that can help with this issue? We need to formally bring you and your clearance on board as part of the Congressional requirement.

I thank you in advance for any help you can provide in this matter.

Best,

Ylli

--

*This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission **of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI. *

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

<OF-306.pdf>

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: Location for 1pm rendezvous

Date: Monday, May 20, 2019 at 1:01:02 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: Michael Gable

I don't see a location for meeting for lunch. Will this be at the hotel?

Thanks,

Eric

Subject: Rendezvous for lunch

Date: Monday, May 20, 2019 at 3:19:56 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

(b) (6),

I'm one of the folks waiting on the security clearance. Where shall I rendezvous with the group for lunch at 1pm? I don't see location information anywhere.

Eric

Subject: AI and Future of Work panel

Date: Monday, May 20, 2019 at 7:10:28 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Subject: RE: Your Google Account password for National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence has been reset by your administrator

Date: Monday, May 20, 2019 at 12:51:12 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: Michael Gable

Can this password be reset? See you at lunch.

From: Michael Gable <(b) (6)>

Sent: Wednesday, May 15, 2019 3:22 PM

To: Eric Horvitz, (b)(6)

Subject: Fwd: Your Google Account password for National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence has been reset by your administrator

MICHAEL GABLE
Chief of Staff
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

Begin forwarded message:

From: The G Suite Team <gsuite-noreply@google.com>

Subject: Your Google Account password for National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence has been reset by your administrator

Date: May 15, 2019 at 6:21:39 PM EDT

To: Mike Gable, (b)(6)

Reply-To: The G Suite Team <gsuite-noreply@google.com>

Google Cloud

Your Google Account password has been reset

Hello Eric,

Your administrator has reset your Google Account password for National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence.

Click **Reset password** below to set a new password. To keep your account secur

follow [these password guidelines](#).

[Reset password](#)

For your security, the reset password link expires after 48 hours. After that, please contact your [administrator](#) for your password.

Regards,

The Google Cloud Team

Google Cloud

© 2019 Google LLC 1600 Amphitheatre Parkway, Mountain View, CA 94043

You're receiving this mandatory email service announcement to update you about important changes to your Google Cloud product or account.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: Accepted: Invitation: NSCAI WG1 Meeting @ Fri Jun 28, 2019 2:30pm - 7pm (EDT)
(Eric Horvitz, (b)(6))

Date: Sunday, June 23, 2019 at 8:53:14 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: **(b) (6)** on behalf of Eric Horvitz

To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Subject: RE: Read ahead materials for NSCAI Working Group, 28 June
Date: Thursday, June 27, 2019 at 6:31:46 AM Eastern Daylight Time
From: Eric Horvitz
To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Thank you (b)(6)!

From: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Sent: Wednesday, June 26, 2019 2:34 PM
To: Andrew Moore <(b)(6)>; Andrew Moore <(b)(6)>; Eric Horvitz <(b)(6)>; Eric Schmidt <(b)(6)>
Cc: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6); Yll Bajraktari <(b)(6)>; NSCAI Staff, (b)(6); Eric Schmidt Support Staff, (b)(6); Eric Schmidt Support Staff, (b)(6); Andrew Moore Support Staff, (b)(6); (b)(6); Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)
Subject: Read ahead materials for NSCAI Working Group, 28 June

Dear Dr. Moore, Dr. Schmidt, Dr. Horvitz,

We're greatly looking forward to Friday's working group meeting, focused on the topic of US government investment in AI R&D. Attached and [linked](#) is the final agenda for the afternoon. We'll begin at 2:30pm and close the executive discussion by 6:30pm.

Should you have an opportunity, we've compiled the following read ahead materials as background for the briefings and executive session discussion:

1. [National AI R&D Strategic Plan: 2019 Update](#) (staff note: this is the update just released last week — it's not the clearest of reads :))
2. [Paper summarizing open source analyses of US vs. China standing in AI research](#)
3. Lay down of primary [federal organizations involved in AI R&D](#)
4. Canada's [Vector Institute model](#) of an AI research institute

Dr. Moore and Dr. Schmidt, we've coordinated with your teams to facilitate access to the Pentagon, and will be ready to escort you to the conference room upon arrival. Dr. Horvitz, we look forward to connecting with you over videoconference.

Respectfully,

(b)(6)

NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Director, Research and Analysis
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

(b)(6)

(b)(6)

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an

endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: RE: Read ahead materials for NSCAI Working Group, 28 June
Date: Thursday, June 27, 2019 at 6:32:54 AM Eastern Daylight Time
From: Eric Horvitz
To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Little nit: It's Dr. James Kurose.

From: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Sent: Wednesday, June 26, 2019 2:34 PM
To: Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>; Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>; Eric Schmidt <(b) (6)>
Cc: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6); Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff, (b)(6); Eric Schmidt Support Staff, (b)(6); Eric Schmidt Support Staff, (b)(6); Andrew Moore Support Staff, (b)(6); (b) (6); Eric Schmidt Support Staff, (b)(6); Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)
Subject: Read ahead materials for NSCAI Working Group, 28 June

Dear Dr. Moore, Dr. Schmidt, Dr. Horvitz,

We're greatly looking forward to Friday's working group meeting, focused on the topic of US government investment in AI R&D. Attached and [linked](#) is the final agenda for the afternoon. We'll begin at 2:30pm and close the executive discussion by 6:30pm.

Should you have an opportunity, we've compiled the following read ahead materials as background for the briefings and executive session discussion:

1. [National AI R&D Strategic Plan: 2019 Update](#) (staff note: this is the update just released last week — it's not the clearest of reads :))
2. [Paper summarizing open source analyses of US vs. China standing in AI research](#)
3. Lay down of primary [federal organizations involved in AI R&D](#)
4. Canada's [Vector Institute model](#) of an AI research institute

Dr. Moore and Dr. Schmidt, we've coordinated with your teams to facilitate access to the Pentagon, and will be ready to escort you to the conference room upon arrival. Dr. Horvitz, we look forward to connecting with you over videoconference.

Respectfully,

(b) (6)

NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Director, Research and Analysis
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an

endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: Tentatively Accepted: NSCAI WG1 Meeting @ Fri Jun 28, 2019 2:30pm - 7pm (EDT)
NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Date: Friday, June 28, 2019 at 3:30:37 PM Eastern Daylight Time
From: Google Calendar on behalf of Eric Horvitz, (b)(6)
To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Attachments: invite.ics

POC: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Please do not edit this section of the description.

This event has a video call.

Join: (b) (6)

+(b) (6) PIN: (b) (6)

View more phone numbers: (b) (6)

Subject: RE: Status Update from the National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence
Date: Tuesday, July 2, 2019 at 10:39:45 AM Eastern Daylight Time
From: Eric Horvitz
To: Eric Schmidt, Yll Bajraktari
CC: Robert Work, Safra Catz, Steve Chien, Mignon Clyburn, Chris Darby, Kenneth Ford, José Marie Griffiths, Andy Jassy, (b)(6), Gilman Louie, William Mark, Jason Matheny, Katharina Mcfarland, Andrew Moore, NSCAI Staff, (b)(6), NSCAI Commissioners, (b)(6)

Thanks for the useful updates. Very good document in support of the Congressional Briefing.
Eric

From: Eric Schmidt <(b) (6)>
Sent: Tuesday, July 2, 2019 6:37 AM
To: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>
Cc: Robert Work <(b) (6)>; Safra Catz <(b) (6)>; Steve Chien <(b) (6)>; Mignon Clyburn <(b) (6)>; Chris Darby <(b) (6)>; Kenneth Ford <(b) (6)>; José Marie Griffiths <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>; Andy Jassy, (b)(6); Gilman Louie <(b) (6)>; William Mark <(b) (6)>; Jason Matheny <(b) (6)>; Katharina Mcfarland <(b) (6)>; Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff, (b)(6); NSCAI Commissioners, (b)(6)

Subject: Re: Status Update from the National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

Ylli,

I want to congratulate you in hiring an amazing staff. The people we are now working with are amazing. I'm sure this guarantees our success !

We had an amazing day in DC and I very much look forward to next week ! Thanks Eric

On Jul 1, 2019, at 9:58 PM, Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)> wrote:

Dear Commissioners,

Below is an update across all of our efforts prepared by (b) (6) (Commission Staff), including:

1. Chair and Vice Chair Congressional Briefing
2. Working Group / Special Project Updates
3. Plenary Information
4. Outreach and Engagement
5. Personnel Update

IMPORTANT: We look forward to seeing you all on July 11th in Cupertino, CA for our next plenary. Materials will be send no later than Monday COB.

1—Chair and Vice Chair Congressional Briefing

Dr. Schmidt and Mr. Work held very successful briefings with House and Senate staff on June 28. The briefings were organized on bipartisan basis by the leadership offices in each chamber. Turnout was impressively high. Staff showed strong interest in the Commission's work and raised important issues and questions.

Talking points drafted for the briefing are [attached here](#).

2—Working Group / Special Project Updates

WG1 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI Research (Moore, Schmidt, Horvitz)

Status: The group held its second meeting on June 28 at the Pentagon (b) (5)

Summary of discussion is being finalized and will be sends out shortly.

WG2 – Maintaining Global Leadership in AI National Security Applications (Catz, Ford, McFarland, Jassy, Chien)

Status: Staff members are conducting engagements with DoD and IC organizations to

(b) (5)

During the next two months, staff will visit some of the most prominent labs and research centers to conduct an analysis for the Commissioners based on the last meeting due outs.

WG3 – Preparing Our Citizens for an AI Future (Griffiths, Work, Mark, Clyburn)

Status: The group continued to engage with DoD, the IC, and other parts of government.

(b) (5)

The group will continue to solicit input and study hiring practices, and begin to plan the next WG meeting. The staff is also working on the due outs from the last working group.

WG4 – International Competitiveness and Cooperation in AI (Matheny, Darby, Louie)

Status: The group held its second meeting on June 20, focused on cooperation with allies and partners. (b) (5)

(Link to summary of discussion [here](#))

Special Project / Partnerships – Special Project staff will visit the Naval Surface Warfare Center Crane, in Indiana, on July 8. (b) (5)

(Draft agenda available [here](#))

Special Project / Ethics – (b) (5)

Special Project / Data – The Special Project continues to invite Commissioners' input and suggestions on projects, organizations, or experts who might offer relevant insights and experiences. Some initial ideas based on WG4 meeting with the allies are emerging.

3—Plenary Information

The next plenary meeting is scheduled for [July 11 in Cupertino, CA](#) (same location as the May meeting). We are coordinating with your staffs on details.

4—Outreach and Engagement

In the past few weeks, NSCAI staff members have engaged with the Joint AI Center, Air Force Research Lab, Army AI Task Force, DARPA, Johns Hopkins Applied Physics Lab, NGA, Yale Law School, CNAS, CNA, Univ. of Chicago, Joint Staff, Ethical Intelligence, RAND, DOE, DIB, Georgetown CSET, Carnegie Mellon SEI . . . and many others.

We are tracking staff engagements in a spreadsheet [linked here](#). So far, we have conducted more than 80 engagements with experts from academia, private sector, think tank, etc.

5—Personnel Update

We have welcomed two new staff members:

-- Michael Lueptow has joined from the Senate Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs Committee to serve as General Counsel to the Commission.

-- (b) (6) has joined from Georgetown University to serve on the Research and Analysis Team, with a focus on supporting Working Group 4.

Please let us know if you have any questions or need more info.

See you next week.

Ylli

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

<Eric Horvitz Support Staff (b) (6)>; Eric Schmidt Support Staff (b) (6)>

Subject: RE: WG1 Outbrief and Talking Points for Plenary

Thanks (b) (6), and sorry that I will not be able to join per my responsibilities at an annual technical advisory board event at our Microsoft Research Lab in Cambridge, UK.

Thanks for putting together the slide.

Thanks also for the notes you had put together and distributed from the last meeting. A few comments and edits on the list we started to grow on "a proposed prioritization of the initial areas identified." You had captured the following directions of investment:

1. (b) (5)
2. (b) (5)
3. (b) (5)
4. (b) (5)
5. (b) (5)
6. (b) (5)

Here are some edits, updates, and expansions that hopefully will help others to understand our discussion:

1. (b) (5)

(b) (5)

(b) (5)

(b) (5)

2. (b) (5) [Redacted]

(b) (5) [Redacted]

3. (b) (5) [Redacted]

(b) (5) [Redacted]

4. (b) (5) [Redacted]

(b) (5) [Redacted]

5. (b) (5) [Redacted]

6. (b) (5) [Redacted]

(b) (5) [Redacted]

(b) (5)

Hope this is useful,

Thanks,
Eric

PS: (b) (5)



From: NSCAI Staff Member (b) (6) >

Sent: Tuesday, July 9, 2019 1:52 PM

To: Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>; Eric Schmidt

(b) (6) >; Andrew Moore (b) (6)

Cc: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff Member (b) (6)>; Michael Gable <(b) (6)>;

Eric Schmidt Support Staff (b) (6) >; Andrew Moore Support Staff (b) (6) >; Eric Horvitz Support Staff (b) (6)

<Eric Horvitz Support Staff (b) (6)>; Eric Schmidt Support Staff (b) (6)>

Subject: WG1 Outbrief and Talking Points for Plenary

Dr. Moore, Dr. Schmidt, Dr. Horvitz,

Ahead of Thursday's plenary session, please find attached the slide we've prepared to brief the full commission on WG1's meeting on 28 June. Also attached are some draft talking points to assist you, Dr. Moore, as you prepare for the briefing.

(b) (6) and I standby to provide any necessary adjustments or additional information, as required.

In addition, we look forward to our working lunch on Thursday, which we'd like to use to begin a discussion around the strengths/weaknesses/considerations of the primary federally-funded organizations involved in AI research as well as some of the new configurations that have been proposed to help foster the level of innovation necessary to maintain US leadership and strengthen national security.

We will also plan to briefly talk through initial ideas around our WG's contributions to the interim report and the timeline and engagement plan for the commission's work through the end of this calendar year.

All best,

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

Director, Research and Analysis

National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: Accepted: Invitation: Call with (b) (6) @ Mon Jul 22, 2019 2pm - 3pm (EDT)
(Eric Horvitz, (b)(6))

Date: Sunday, July 21, 2019 at 7:45:09 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: Yll Bajraktari, (b)(6)

Subject: RE: NSCAI Special Project - AI Data

Date: Tuesday, July 23, 2019 at 2:18:04 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6), Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6)

CC: Yll Bajraktari, Michael Gable, NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6), NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6), Staff

(b) (6),

It's good to hear from you. I don't know that I can be in DC on these days in Sept., but would love to get some time in advance with folks to reflect about directions and goals of the special project. Can you work with (b) (6) to find an hour for us?

Eric

From: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

Sent: Tuesday, July 23, 2019 7:44 AM

To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>

Cc: Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>; Michael Gable <(b) (6)>;

NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6); NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6); Staff <(b) (6)>

Subject: Re: NSCAI Special Project - AI Data

(Resending to Dr. Horvitz' Microsoft email.)

On Tue, Jul 23, 2019 at 10:41 AM NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6) wrote:

Dr. Horvitz,

A quick note to follow up with the July 23rd NSCAI Status Update regarding the Special Project on AI Data. As you know "data" is a critical cross-cutting topic particularly driving research and operational applications. Your shaping input would be of great benefit to this project, and your participation is greatly welcomed in any role or capacity.

The objective of this special project is to identify strategic opportunities to address AI data and infrastructure needs and challenges to maintain US global leadership and strengthen US national security and defense. With a proposed approach to assess the AI data landscape and develop recommendations to accelerate AI technology innovation to address national security and defense needs. This includes attention to:

1. AI data and infrastructure to advance AI research (WG1)
2. AI data and infrastructure to promote AI operational application (WG2)
3. AI data for workforce development and training (WG3)

4. AI data sharing among allies to maintain competitive advantage over adversaries (WG4)

Would you have interest and availability to provide the project team leading advisement and support?
Might you have availability to participate (in-person or remotely) in the one-day workshop we are planning in DC – looking at tentatively September 17, 18, or 19?

Thank you for your leadership to the Commission and for any consideration.

Warmly,

(b) (6)

--

NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)

(b) (6), NSCAI

(b) (6)

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: RE: Upcoming NSCAI Staff Trip to Seattle
Date: Wednesday, August 14, 2019 at 8:48:58 AM Eastern Daylight Time
From: Eric Horvitz
To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
CC: Yll Bajraktari, NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6), Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6), Michael Gable, Staff

(b) (6),

Thanks for reaching out. I'm happy to have this conversation and to arrange for a session that would provide an update on AI research and on the responsible fielding of AI technologies, with an overview of our efforts on the Aether Committee (AI, effects, and ethics in engineering and research). On dates and times and my availability to host (given my forthcoming Sept. travel, can you work with (b) (6)?

Eric

From: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6)
Sent: Tuesday, August 13, 2019 7:20 AM
To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>
Cc: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6); Eric Horvitz Support Staff, (b)(6); Michael Gable <(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff, (b)(6)
Subject: Upcoming NSCAI Staff Trip to Seattle

Dear Dr. Horvitz,

I hope your summer is going well! As part of the Commission's assessment phase, the NSCAI staff is conducting fact-finding trips nationwide to meet with relevant stakeholders to inform research for the November report. In September (11-13) our team is planning a stop in Seattle, where there are many relevant institutions and companies we would like to meet.

We would like to start our visit to Seattle by meeting with you to provide an update on working group 1 and broader commission efforts. If feasible, we'd also be eager to visit with some of your team at Microsoft Research, to talk through issues related to Microsoft's AI research as well as discuss ethics and its integration into research and application processes.

The overarching goal of the trip is to meet with experts in the field in order to learn from those driving the cutting edge of AI research in order to inform our assessment of the AI ecosystem in the U.S. and eventual recommendations across the Commission's working groups. This will follow a similar trip to Boston in late August.

I've included below the internal guiding research questions we've developed to focus our engagements, as well as a prioritized list for outreach. Given this is your backyard, we'd warmly welcome any recommendations as to specific organizations/researchers we should seek to engage. In addition, where appropriate, we'd welcome any connections you could make to facilitate coordination of conversations.

Many thanks in advance for your attention on this effort.

Respectfully,

(b) (6)

Guiding Research Questions:

1. (b) (5)
2. (b) (5)

3. (b) (5)
4. (b) (5)
5. (b) (5)
6. (b) (5)
7. (b) (5)
8. (b) (5)
9. (b) (5)
10. (b) (5)

Outreach Priorities:

1. (b) (5)
 - a. (b) (5)
 - b. (b) (5)
 - c. (b) (5)
 - d. (b) (5)
 - e. (b) (5)
2. (b) (5)
3. (b) (5)
4. (b) (5)
5. (b) (5)
6. (b) (5)
7. (b) (5)
8. (b) (5)

--

Director, Research and Analysis
National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

(b) (6)
(b) (6)

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: RE: NSCAI Research Priorities Matrix

Date: Friday, August 23, 2019 at 3:39:06 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: Yll Bajraktari

CC: Andrew Moore, Eric Schmidt, (b)(6)

Thanks for the transparency (and honesty 😊).

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>

Sent: Friday, August 23, 2019 12:30 PM

To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>

Cc: Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>; Eric Schmidt, (b)(6)

Subject: Re: NSCAI Research Priorities Matrix

Eric,

This sounds lame but the file was locked and we couldn't add your input. As soon as we unlock it, we will add it.

Andrew: can you pls unlock the file :)

On Fri, Aug 23, 2019 at 02:20 Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Andrew--and Yll,

Thanks for sending the matrix out to folks on the committee. (b) (5)

See discussion on the clarification below.

Eric

From: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>

Sent: Tuesday, July 16, 2019 2:05 PM

To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>

Cc: Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>; Eric Schmidt <(b) (6)>; Bob Work

<(b) (6)>; Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff Member (b) (6); (b) (6)

NSCAI Staff Member (b) (6); Michael Gable <(b) (6)>

Subject: Re: WG1 Outbrief and Talking Points for Plenary

Eric,

Chiming in here from the cc line. (b) (5)

(b) (5)

(b) (5)

Happy to convene a call for us all to level on our goals and the expectations from Congress on this front, should that be of value.

Thanks to you both — your expertise here is essential to define these critical research areas. We are here to support you.

Best,

Ylli

On Jul 12, 2019, at 5:12 PM, Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Thanks Andrew.

Andrew, Eric—and Bob:

(b) (5)

(b) (5)

(b) (5)

(b) (5)

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

Thoughts?

Eric

From: Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>
Sent: Friday, July 12, 2019 11:21 AM
To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>
Cc: Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>; Bob Work <(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff Member (b) (6)
NSCAI Staff Member (b) (6)>; Eric Schmidt <(b) (6)>; Yll Bajraktari
<(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff Member (b) (6)>; Michael Gable <(b) (6)>
Subject: Re: WG1 Outbrief and Talking Points for Plenary

I'd be happy to do so but I need Yll's guidance. (b) (5)

On Thu, Jul 11, 2019 at 4:23 PM Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Here's the proposed Area 7, sent in a separate email message earlier today:

All,

I had meant to add a potential seventh area for investigation on our initial areas identified for investments in AI. As these are intriguing areas for competition, competitive edge for national security (and economy), I'll include several sample directions and papers. Worth taking a look at the abstracts, if not the papers:

From: Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>
Sent: Thursday, July 11, 2019 7:43:27 PM
To: Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>; Bob Work <(b) (6)>
Cc: NSCAI Staff Member (b) (6); Eric Schmidt <(b) (6)>;
Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>; Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff Member (b) (6)
<(b) (6)>; Michael Gable <(b) (6)>
Subject: Re: WG1 Outbrief and Talking Points for Plenary

Oops. Adding Bob.

On Thu, Jul 11, 2019 at 11:42 AM Andrew Moore <(b) (6)> wrote:
taking out addresses of non-NSCAI folks

Folks,

I have takes the liberty of taking the basic research areas, expanding them a little, including EricH's excellent descriptions (and adding in a couple of cases) and putting them in this sheet:

(b) (5)

(b) (5)

Please feel welcome to add, alter or subtract from this as you wish, and/or leave comments.

Thanks!

Andrew

On Wed, Jul 10, 2019 at 12:31 AM Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)> wrote:

Thanks (b) (6), and sorry that I will not be able to join per my responsibilities at an annual technical advisory board event at our Microsoft Research Lab in Cambridge, UK.

Thanks for putting together the slide.

Thanks also for the notes you had put together and distributed from the last meeting. A few comments and edits on the list we started to grow on "a proposed prioritization of the initial areas identified." You had captured the following directions of investment:

1. (b) (5)
2. (b) (5)

3. (b) (5)

(b) (5)

4. (b) (5)

(b) (5)

5. (b) (5)

6. (b) (5)

(b) (5)

(b) (5)

Hope this is useful,
Thanks,
Eric

(b) (5)



From: NSCAI Staff Member (b) (6) >
Sent: Tuesday, July 9, 2019 1:52 PM
To: Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>; Eric Horvitz <(b) (6)>; Eric Schmidt <(b) (6)>; Andrew Moore <(b) (6)>
Cc: Yll Bajraktari <(b) (6)>; NSCAI Staff Member (b) (6)>; Michael Gable <(b) (6)>; Eric Schmidt Support Staff (b) (6); (b) (6) Andrew Moore Support Staff, (b)(6); Eric Horvitz Support Staff (b) (6); (b) (6) Eric Schmidt Support Staff (b) (6)
Subject: WG1 Outbrief and Talking Points for Plenary

Dr. Moore, Dr. Schmidt, Dr. Horvitz,

Ahead of Thursday's plenary session, please find attached the slide we've prepared to

brief the full commission on WG1's meeting on 28 June. Also attached are some draft talking points to assist you, Dr. Moore, as you prepare for the briefing.

(b) (6) and I standby to provide any necessary adjustments or additional information, as required.

In addition, we look forward to our working lunch on Thursday, which we'd like to use to begin a discussion around the strengths/weaknesses/considerations of the primary federally-funded organizations involved in AI research as well as some of the new configurations that have been proposed to help foster the level of innovation necessary to maintain US leadership and strengthen national security.

We will also plan to briefly talk through initial ideas around our WG's contributions to the interim report and the timeline and engagement plan for the commission's work through the end of this calendar year.

All best,

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

Director, Research and Analysis

National Security Commission on Artificial Intelligence

(b) (6)

(b) (6)

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

This message is private and may contain confidential information or other matter otherwise protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please telephone or email the sender and delete this message and any attachment from your system; you must not copy or disclose the contents of this message or any attachment to any other person. Transmission of any material prepared by a third-party should not be construed to constitute an endorsement of that material or any analysis or commentary therein by the NSCAI.

Subject: NSCAI Visit to Microsoft

Date: Thursday, September 5, 2019 at 3:21:40 PM Eastern Daylight Time

From: Eric Horvitz

To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6), (b) (6)

CC: Conf Room (b) (6)

Confirming your meeting at Microsoft. Eric will send the agenda prior to the meeting. Thank you!

Meeting Date/Time:

Thursday, September 12, 2019 – 9:00-11:00am PST
(coffee and light refreshments available at 8:30am)

Meeting Location:

Microsoft West Campus – Building 99
14820 NE 36th Street
Redmond, WA 98052

Conference Room (b) (6)

Please ask for (b) (6) at the reception desk

(b) (6)

Executive Assistant to Eric Horvitz

Tel: (b) (6) | Cell: (b) (6)

(b) (6) <[<mailto:\(b\) \(6\)>](mailto:(b) (6))>

[cid:image001.png@01D563BC.CDEB5090]

Subject: NSCAI Visit to Microsoft

Date: Thursday, September 5, 2019 at 10:39:20 AM Eastern Daylight Time

From: (b) (6) on behalf of Eric Horvitz

To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6), (b) (6)

Confirming your meeting at Microsoft. Eric will send the agenda prior to the meeting. Thank you!

Meeting Date/Time:

Thursday, September 12, 2019 – 9:00-11:00am PST
(coffee and light refreshments available at 8:30am)

Meeting Location:

Microsoft West Campus – Building 99
14820 NE 36th Street
Redmond, WA 98052

Conference Room (b) (6)

Please ask for (b) (6) at the reception desk

(b) (6)

Executive Assistant to Eric Horvitz

Tel: (b) (6) | Cell: (b) (6)

(b) (6) <[\(b\) \(6\)](mailto:(b) (6))>

[cid:image001.png@01D563BC.CDEB5090]

Subject: NSCAI Visit to Microsoft

Date: Friday, September 6, 2019 at 1:08:30 AM Eastern Daylight Time

From: (b) (6) on behalf of Eric Horvitz

To: NSCAI Staff Member, (b)(6), (b) (6)

CC: Conf Room (b) (6)

Confirming your meeting at Microsoft. Thank you!

Meeting Date/Time:

Thursday, September 12, 2019 – 9:00-11:30am PST
(coffee and light refreshments available at 8:30am)

Meeting Location:

Microsoft West Campus – Building 99
14820 NE 36th Street
Redmond, WA 98052

Conference Room (b) (6)

Please ask for (b) (6) at the reception desk

Agenda:

9:00-10:00 Welcome / AI R&D overview – Eric Horvitz

10:00-10:40 Azure AI Platform – (b) (6)

10:45-11:15 Best practices with scaling 1st & 3rd party AI – Eric, (b) (6)

11:15-11:30 Federal programs – (b) (6)

(b) (6)

Executive Assistant to Eric Horvitz

Tel: (b) (6) | Cell: (b) (6)

(b) (6) <[<mailto:\(b\) \(6\)>](mailto:(b) (6))>

[cid:<image001.png@01D563BC.CDEB5090>]